1			
2			OUNTY OF ORANGE BOARD OF APPEALS
3	IOWN OF NEWBORG		X
4	III CHE Matter of		
5			
6	APJ ENTERPI	RISES OF N	IEWBURGH, LLC
7		de Road, N 1: Block 1	Newburgh L; Lot 74.1
8		R-1 Zone	
9			X
10			
11		Date:	October 24, 2024
12		Time: Place:	7:00 p.m. Town of Newburgh
13			Town Hall 1496 Route 300
14			Newburgh, New York
15			
16	BOARD MEMBERS:	JAMES EI	SCALZO, Chairman BERHART, JR.
17		JOHN MAS	
18		DONNA RI	EIN
19	ALSO PRESENT:		ONOVAN, ESQ.
20		JOSEPH I SIOBHAN	MATTINA JABLESNIK
21			
22			
23		ELLE L. C	
24	Michelle	ourt Repor	tmail.com
25	()	845)541-41	103

1 APJ Enterprises of Newburgh, LLC

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Good evening. 3 I'd like to call the meeting of the 4 Zoning Board of Appeals to order. The 5 first order of business are the public 6 hearings which are scheduled.

7 The procedure of the Board is that 8 the applicant will be called upon to step 9 forward, state their request and explain 10 why it should be granted. The Board will 11 then ask the applicant any questions it 12 may have, and then any questions or 13 comments from the public will be 14 entertained. The Board will then consider 15 the applications and will try to render a 16 decision this evening, but may take up to 17 62 days to reach a determination. Т 18 would ask that if you have a cellphone, 19 to please turn it off or put it on 20 silent. When speaking, speak directly 21 into the microphone as it's being 22 recorded by our stenographer.

23 Roll call, please.

24 MS. JABLESNIK: Darrell Bell is 25 supposed to be here, so we'll wait and

3 APJ Enterprises of Newburgh, LLC 1 2 see. 3 James Eberhart. 4 MR. EBERHART: Present. 5 MS. JABLESNIK: Greg Hermance. 6 MR. HERMANCE: Here. 7 MS. JABLESNIK: John Masten. 8 MR. MASTEN: Here. 9 MS. JABLESNIK: Donna Rein. 10 MS. REIN: Here. 11 MS. JABLESNIK: Darrin Scalzo. 12 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Here. 13 MS. JABLESNIK: Also present is our 14 Attorney, Dave Donovan; from Code 15 Compliance, Joseph Mattina; and our 16 Stenographer, Michelle Conero. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: If you would all 18 please rise for the Pledge. 19 (Pledge of Allegiance.) 20 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Before I actually 21 get started with the formal agenda, I 22 have a few announcements. If anyone is 23 here this evening to comment on APJ 24 Enterprises of Newburgh, Lakeside Road, 25 they have contacted us and have asked for

APJ Enterprises of Newburgh, LLC an additional month to gather the materials that we had requested from them at last month's meeting. We will not be hearing the APJ Enterprises application this evening. If anybody is here, you can hang around, because it's really cool what we do. If not, you're free to go. (Time noted: 7:03 p.m.)

1	APJ Enterprises of Newburgh, LLC
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	
24	
25	

1		
2		RK : COUNTY OF ORANGE ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS
3		X
4	In the Matter of	
5		
6	PRIM	E AND TUVEL
7		le Road, Newburgh
8		Block 1; Lot 39.3 B Zone
9		77
10		X
11		Date: October 24, 2024
12		Time: 7:03 p.m. Place: Town of Newburgh Town Hall
13		1496 Route 300 Newburgh, New York
14		Newburgh, New TOIK
15	BOARD MEMBERS:	DARRIN SCALZO, Chairman
16	DOARD MEMBERG.	JAMES EBERHART, JR. GREGORY M. HERMANCE
17		JOHN MASTEN DONNA REIN
18		DONNA ILLIN
19	ALSO PRESENT:	DAVID DONOVAN, ESQ. JOSEPH MATTINA
20		SIOBHAN JABLESNIK
21		
22		
23		X LLE L. CONERO
24	Cou	rt Reporter onero@hotmail.com
25		5) 541-4163

1 Prime and Tuvel

CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Also this evening, Prime and Tuvel, which is 2 Lakeside Road, otherwise known as the QuickChek application, we are waiting for some information back on our side of things. We let the applicant know that we cannot act this evening, we have not heard or gotten the information back that we need, so that is also not being heard this evening. If anyone is here for the QuickChek, we will not be discussing that application this evening. (Time noted: 7:04 p.m.)

1	Prime and Tuvel
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	
23	MICHELLE CONERO
24	
25	

1		9
2		COUNTY OF ORANGE
3		- $ -$ X
4	In the Matter of	
5		
6		ALO CONTRERAS
7	Section 34; B	ane, Newburgh Block 3; Lot 10.2 Cone
8		lone
9		X
10		a + a + a + a + a + a + a + a + a + a +
11	Т	ate: October 24, 2024 ime: 7:04 p.m.
12	P	lace: Town of Newburgh Town Hall
13		1496 Route 300 Newburgh, New York
14		
15		ARRIN SCALZO, Chairman
16	G	AMES EBERHART, JR. REGORY M. HERMANCE
17		OHN MASTEN ONNA REIN
18		
19	J	AVID DONOVAN, ESQ. Oseph Mattina
20	S	IOBHAN JABLESNIK
21	APPLICANT'S REPRESEN	TATIVE: JOSE OTAVALO CONTRERAS
22		
23		X
24	Court	E L. CONERO Reporter
25		ero@hotmail.com 541-4163

1 Jose Otavalo Contreras

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Moving on to our 3 regular agenda. Our first applicant this evening is Jose Otavalo Contreras, 3 Becks 4 5 Lane in Newburgh, seeking an area variance of increasing the degree of nonconformity 6 7 of the front and side yards to build a 8 second story addition. 9 Do we have mailings on this, 10 Siobhan? 11 MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent 12 35 letters. 13 The County has timed out. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's great. 15 MS. JABLESNIK: I haven't heard 16 back. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Do we have anyone 18 here this evening for the Jose Contreras, 19 3 Becks Lane application? Please step 20 forward. Let us know who we have with us 21 tonight because it's being recorded. 22 MR. CONTRERAS: I'm Jose Contreras. 23 My property is on 3 Becks Lane. 24 At this time I'm trying to put a 25 second floor. You know, my property

11 1 Jose Otavalo Contreras 2 isn't biq. 3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. We're 4 all obliged by our positions here to go 5 take a look. I actually drove past your 6 place today. 7 It's my understanding that you're 8 only looking to go up, you're not 9 expanding out any further than you 10 already are. 11 MR. CONTRERAS: Just going up. 12 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Just going up? 13 MR. CONTRERAS: Yeah. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: So for those of 14 15 you, members of the public, that are 16 curious as to why he may be here if he's 17 just going up, when you go up in a 18 building, that does increase the degree 19 of nonconformity. That's why the 20 applicant landed with us. 21 Very good. I have no comments on 22 this application. 23 I'm going to turn to the Members of 24 the Board. I'm going to start to my 25 right with Mr. Eberhart.

12 1 Jose Otavalo Contreras 2 MR. EBERHART: No comment. 3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. 4 Mr. Hermance, do you have comments 5 regarding this application? MR. HERMANCE: I have none. 6 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Masten? 8 MR. MASTEN: Not at this time. 9 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Ms. Rein, do you 10 have any comments? 11 MS. REIN: Dave, is this a Type 2? 12 MR. DONOVAN: It's a Type 2 action. 13 MS. REIN: Then no comments. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: At this time T'll 14 15 open it up to any members of the public 16 that wish to speak about this application. 17 MR. STRAVALLE: I just --18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Please state your 19 name. Stand up. 20 MR. STRAVALLE: I'm sorry. John 21 Stravalle, I'm at 11 Becks Lane, two 22 houses up. I've been there for over 23 forty years. 24 My only concern, I want to know, is 25 it going to be a rental or a residence?

13 1 Jose Otavalo Contreras 2 MR. CONTRERAS: I'm going to move 3 to there. UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: He's going 4 5 to move. MR. STRAVALLE: I'm sorry. I'm as 6 7 deaf as can be. 8 The only other question is, when I 9 bought my house they made me do a road 10 maintenance agreement. Is there any plan -- what are you going to do about the 11 12 snow? For forty years I've been plowing 13 that road. She'll tell you. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Sir, I appreciate --15 MR. STRAVALLE: I know it has 16 nothing to do with you guys. 17 MR. DONOVAN: Now that you've got 18 him here, you want to ask. 19 MR. STRAVALLE: I understand. 20 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The rub is, as 21 you guys --22 MR. STRAVALLE: I don't care if he 23 puts a mansion up there. It's only going 24 to make my house worth more money. 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: What I'm going to

1 Jose Otavalo Contreras

2 recommend is, other questions that are 3 not related to this application, as you 4 quys exit the building it will probably 5 be at the same time, so you should probably have all of your questions 6 7 answered that don't apply to this 8 application --MR. STRAVALLE: I'm fine with two 9 10 It's a small house and a big stories. 11 piece of property. 12 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I don't mean to 13 raise my voice. I'm just trying to help 14 you --15 MR. STRAVALLE: I'm deaf. I'm 16 sorry. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's okay. 18 Are there any other members of the 19 public that wish to speak about this 20 application at 3 Becks Lane? 21 We've got one coming up from the 22 back. Please state your name, sir. 23 MR. ROMERO: Hank Romero on Todd 24 Lane. 25 3 Becks Lane, did I understand

1	Jose Otavalo Contreras 15
2	right that it's going to be just a
3	residence only?
4	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: A residence only.
5	Actually, let me just say, that also does
6	not necessarily sit within the application.
7	The application is for the building to go
8	up one story. That's why they're here.
9	Anything else related to residence, if
10	it's going to be a rental, if he's going
11	to plow it, that has nothing to do with
12	why the applicant is here.
13	MR. ROMERO: I just want to say
14	that they've done an excellent job
15	keeping up their property, the trimming
16	and the lawn.
17	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm happy to hear
18	that. If you're exiting the building at
19	the same time they are, you can pat him
20	on the back and thank him.
21	Are there any other members of the
22	public that wish to speak about this
23	application?
24	(No response.)
25	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. I'm going

1	Jose Otavalo Contreras 16
2	to look back to the Board. Any other
3	comments?
4	MR. HERMANCE: No.
5	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. In
6	this instance I'll look to the Board for
7	a motion to close the public hearing.
8	MR. MASTEN: I'll make a motion to
9	close the public hearing.
10	MS. REIN: I'll second it.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion
12	to close the public hearing from Mr. Masten.
13	We have a second from Ms. Rein. All in
14	favor.
15	MR. EBERHART: Aye.
16	MR. HERMANCE: Aye.
17	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye.
18	MR. MASTEN: Aye.
19	MS. REIN: Aye.
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed?
21	(No response.)
22	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. This
23	is a Type 2 action under SEQRA. Ms. Rein
24	asked Counsel about that a little earlier,
25	so we're ahead of it.

1 Jose Otavalo Contreras

2 In this instance we are going to 3 go through the area variance criteria and discuss the five factors which we 4 5 are weighing, the first one being whether or not the benefit can be 6 7 achieved by other means feasible to 8 the applicant. Well, the benefit he's 9 seeking is to go up a second story. 10 There's no other way to do that. 11 The second, if there's an 12 undesirable change in the neighborhood 13 character or a detriment to nearby 14 properties. Actually, I think we 15 just heard testimony from the public that they like what he's done with 16 17 the property already. I would say 18 It's actually a desirable change no. 19 to the neighborhood. 20 The third, whether the request is 21 substantial. Well, not really. He's not 22 increasing the footprint of the house, 23 he's just going up. 24 The fourth, whether the request will 25 have adverse physical or environmental

1	Jose Otavalo Contreras 1
2	effects. It does not appear so.
3	Jump in if anybody thinks I'm
4	going astray here.
5	The fifth, whether the alleged
6	difficulty is self-created, which is
7	relevant but not determinative. Of
8	course this is self-created.
9	Having gone through the balancing
10	tests, does the Board have a motion
11	of some sort regarding this application?
12	MR. EBERHART: I'll make a motion
13	for approval.
14	MR. MASTEN: I'll second it.
15	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion
16	for approval from Mr. Eberhart. We have
17	a second from Mr. Masten.
18	Can you roll on that, please,
19	Siobhan.
20	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart?
21	MR. EBERHART: Yes.
22	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance?
23	MR. HERMANCE: Yes.
24	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten?
25	MR. MASTEN: Yes.

Jose Otavalo Contreras MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein? MS. REIN: Yes. MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo? CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. The motion is carried. The variances are approved. Good luck, gentlemen. MR. CONTRERAS: Thank you. (Time noted: 7:13 p.m.)

1	Jose Otavalo Contreras
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	MICHELLE CONERO
24	
25	

1			:
2			OUNTY OF ORANGE BOARD OF APPEALS
3			- $ X$
4	In the Matter of		
5	МТСЦЛЕТ	& STEPHA	ANTE WAY
6			
7	Section 1		Newburgh 4; Lot 15
8	-		
9			X
10		Dato.	October 24, 2024
11		Time: Place:	7:13 p.m.
12		1 1000.	Town Hall 1496 Route 300
13			Newburgh, New York
14			
15	BOARD MEMBERS:		SCALZO, Chairman SERHART, JR.
16			M. HERMANCE
17		DONNA RE	
18			
19	ALSO PRESENT:	JOSEPH N	DNOVAN, ESQ. Mattina Jablesnik
20		STODIAN	OADIESNIK
21	APPLICANT'S REPRES		S: MICHAEL WAY & PHANIE WAY
22			V//
23			X
24		irt Report	ter
25		45)541-41	

22 1 Michael and Stephanie Way 2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Our second 3 applicant this evening is Michael and Stephanie Way on 8 Chads Ford Lane, 4 5 Newburgh seeking an area variance of the minimum rear yard setback to construct a 6 7 14 by 24 foot pool deck. 8 Do we have mailings on this, Siobhan? 9 10 MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent 11 40 letters. 12 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 40. That's quite 13 a bit. Who do we have? 14 15 MS. WAY: I'm Stephanie Way. 16 MR. WAY: Good evening. Mike Way. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Folks, very nice 18 to see you here. Glad you made it out. 19 If I have captured what it is that you're 20 looking to do in that one stunning 21 sentence, we can move on. If you have 22 any flavor you want to add to that, we 23 can do that, too. 24 MR. WAY: You got it. 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: All right. I

1 Michael and Stephanie Way

2 actually drove by myself this evening and 3 saw a couple kids throwing the ball in 4 the driveway. I see what you're looking 5 to do. The sun was setting and it was right in my eyes, so I couldn't see the 6 7 yard that well. 8 I don't have any comments or 9 questions really. I know what you're 10 trying to do. Coming in and out of a pool on a ladder is a challenge. Anyway, 11 12 I have nothing. 13 Ms. Rein? MS. REIN: 14 No. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Masten? 16 MR. MASTEN: No. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Hermance? 18 MR. HERMANCE: I have nothing. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Eberhart? 20 MR. EBERHART: I have nothing. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: At this point I'm 22 going to open it up to any members of the 23 public that wish to speak about this 24 application. Is there anyone here that 25 wants to speak about the Michael and

1	Michael and Stephanie Way 24
2	Stephanie Way application?
3	(No response.)
4	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. It might
5	be an early night.
6	MR. DONOVAN: Mr. Chairman, can I
7	ask a question? Does anyone know how
8	this got to be named Chads Ford Lane?
9	The reason I ask
10	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You have a friend
11	named Chads Ford.
12	MR. DONOVAN: I do not. I do not.
13	I have an interest in the American
14	Revolution.
15	So the Battle of Brandywine Creek
16	fought in September of 1777 was adjacent
17	to Chads Ford. It was a horrible defeat
18	for the Americans and the British ended
19	up in Philadelphia a couple weeks later.
20	I was there, Longwood Gardens. I don't
21	know if you guys are familiar with that.
22	It has nothing to do with anything. I
23	was fascinated with the fact that it's
24	named Chads Ford.
25	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I didn't realize

1	Michael and Stephanie Way 25
2	Brandywine was part of that as well.
3	MS. REIN: Dave, you were there?
4	MR. DONOVAN: I walked the
5	battlefield.
6	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You guys are
7	taking home something special tonight.
8	MS. WAY: We didn't know that
9	either.
10	MS. JABLESNIK: Maybe the guy who
11	did the subdivision is a huge history
12	buff.
13	MR. DONOVAN: Could be. I don't
14	know.
15	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Think about your
16	next party and all the great conversation
17	that's coming out of this.
18	Does anyone from the public wish to
19	speak about this application?
20	(No response.)
21	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: No. You've got
22	to have fun at these meetings.
23	One last look at the Board.
24	MS. REIN: I'm good.
25	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very look. I'll

1	Michael and Stephanie Way 26
2	look to the Board for a motion to close
3	the public hearing.
4	MR. MASTEN: I'll make the motion
5	to close the public hearing.
6	MS. REIN: I'll second it.
7	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion
8	to close from Mr. Masten. We have a
9	second from Ms. Rein. All in favor.
10	MR. EBERHART: Aye.
11	MR. HERMANCE: Aye.
12	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye.
13	MR. MASTEN: Aye.
14	MS. REIN: Aye.
15	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed?
16	(No response.)
17	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good.
18	Counsel, this is a Type 2 action
19	under SEQRA?
20	MR. DONOVAN: That is correct, Mr.
21	Chairman.
22	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You just heard us
23	go through the five factors. We're going
24	to do the five for you, too.
25	The first one, whether or not the

1 Michael and Stephanie Way

benefit can be achieved by other means 2 3 feasible to the applicant. Going up and 4 down a ladder to get in the pool is a 5 little tough. If you look at the orientation of the deck on the survey 6 7 sketch, I know what it is, it's not 8 really pushing it further back. 9 Second, if there's an undesirable 10 change to the neighborhood character or a 11 detriment to nearby properties. 12 MS. REIN: No. 13 MR. MASTEN: No. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You might see it 15 from the street and maybe the one 16 neighbor behind. As you come up Chads 17 Ford Lane, it's sitting so high, you 18 won't see a thing. 19 The third, whether the request is 20 substantial. Perhaps by the numbers it 21 is, but really when you look at the way the lot is laid out, it does not seem so. 22 23 Fourth, whether the request will 24 have adverse physical or environmental 25 effects.

28 1 Michael and Stephanie Way 2 MR. EBERHART: No. 3 MR. HERMANCE: No. 4 MR. MASTEN: No. 5 MS. REIN: No. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It does not 6 7 appear so. 8 The fifth, whether the alleged 9 difficulty is self-created, which is relevant but not determinative. Of 10 11 course it's self-created. 12 Having gone through the balancing 13 tests, does the Board have a motion of 14 some sort? 15 MS. REIN: I'll make a motion to 16 approve. 17 MR. HERMANCE: I'll second. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 19 for approval from Ms. Rein. We have a 20 second, I believe it was Mr. Hermance. 21 MR. HERMANCE: Yes. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Can you roll on 23 that, please, Siobhan. MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart? 24 25 MR. EBERHART: Yes.

Michael and Stephanie Way MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance? MR. HERMANCE: Yes. MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten? MR. MASTEN: Yes. MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein? MS. REIN: Yes. MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo? CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. The motion is carried. The variances are approved. Go and take that colonial United States knowledge with you. MR. WAY: Thank you. MS. WAY: Thank you very much. (Time noted: 7:18 p.m.)

1	Michael and Stephanie Way
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	MICHELLE CONERO
24	
25	

1			:	
2	STATE OF NEW YORK : COUNTY OF ORANGE TOWN OF NEWBURGH ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS			
3	In the Matter of			
4				
5	KURT E. JOHNSON 40 Old South Plank Road, Newburgh Section 52; Block 1; Lot 7 R-1 Zone			
6				
7				
8				
9			X	
10		Date:	October 24, 2024	
11		Time: Place:	7:18 p.m.	
12		11400.	Town Hall 1496 Route 300	
13			Newburgh, New York	
14				
15	BOARD MEMBERS:		SCALZO, Chairman	
16			JAMES EBERHART, JR. GREGORY M. HERMANCE	
17		DONNA R		
18				
19	ALSO PRESENT:	DAVID DONOVAN, ESQ. JOSEPH MATTINA SIOBHAN JABLESNIK		
20		STODIAN	OADLESNIK	
21	APPLICANT'S REPR	ESENTATIVE	: KURT E. JOHNSON	
22				
23			X	
24	MICHELLE L. CONERO Court Reporter Michelleconero@hotmail.com			
25		(845)541-41		

2	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Our next
3	applicant this evening is Kurt Johnson,
4	40 Old South Plank Road. Mr. Johnson is
5	seeking an interpretation of the
6	ordinance. The Code Compliance
7	Department issued a notice of violation
8	for building a dock without a permit.
9	Siobhan, do we have mailings on
10	this?
11	MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent
12	out 29 letters.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 29 letters. Very
14	good.
15	Do we have anyone here this evening
16	that is
17	MR. JOHNSON: Kurt Johnson.
18	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Johnson.
19	Very nice. I don't want to say it's
20	rare, but we don't get interpretations
21	nearly as much as we get applications,
22	people asking for forgiveness or
23	permission. Here we are, we have
24	
	somebody looking for an interpretation.

1 Kurt E. Johnson

2 was that the violation was for building a 3 deck. What we really were doing was 4 putting a dock out. There was no 5 requirement that I saw in the code 6 requiring a building permit for a dock. 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okav. 8 MR. JOHNSON: It seems very clear 9 it isn't required. Likewise, if it's not 10 required under the municipal ordinance, 11 it's not required under the uniform code 12 either. 13 That's certainly CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 14 an interesting spin. My interpretation 15 of this, and I see where the -- I visited 16 the site. Your deck or dock, tomato, 17 tomatoe, whatever you'd like to call it, 18 is a structure that is sitting upon 19 something that needs to be built to a 20 code that can support people. The only 21 way for you to ensure that that's 22 happening is to get a permit and have the 23 Building Department inspect these types 24 of structures so that they are safe. 25 Now, if it was a floating dock, I

1 Kurt E. Johnson

2 don't think you'd be standing here. In 3 this instance, you're in the ground out 4 there. 5 MR. JOHNSON: No. It's built on It's a dock that sits on cribs --6 cribs. 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. 8 MR. JOHNSON: -- which are basically just wooden structures filled 9 10 with stone to keep them in place. 11 MR. DONOVAN: Mr. Chairman, if I 12 can for a second. We have, if I read 13 this correctly, two things going on. 14 One, there's a request for an interpretation of 185.48-3. Correct? 15 16 MR. JOHNSON: Correct. 17 MR. DONOVAN: Is there also a 18 request for an interpretation of Section 19 71 of the Town Code? 20 MR. JOHNSON: I'm not familiar. 21 MR. DONOVAN: 71 is, I think, part 22 of the violation that was written which 23 requires you to get a building permit. 24 MR. JOHNSON: No. There's no 25 request with respect to that. It's only

1 Kurt E. Johnson

2 a request with respect to the stop work 3 order. 4 MR. DONOVAN: It's a matter of 5 jurisdiction. This Board has 6 jurisdiction over Chapter 185, to issue 7 an interpretation under 185. We have no 8 authority to issue an interpretation to any other part of the code. 9 10 The Building Department, Mr. 11 Mattina, is here. The stop work order 12 doesn't seem to impact or rely upon 13 section 185-48.3. Correct, Joe? 14 MR. MATTINA: Well --15 MR. DONOVAN: Not to put you on the 16 spot. It looks like -- not you 17 personally -- Code Compliance issued the 18 remedy based upon a violation of Section 19 105.2, building permits, and also Code 20 Section 71-8, neither of which this Board 21 has jurisdiction over.

22 MR. MATTINA: Well, that's not how 23 I understand it from the Town Attorney. 24 The Town Attorney says you have 25 jurisdiction over the stop work order

2 since it's in Town Municipal Code 71. 3 MR. DONOVAN: If it's a stop work 4 order that has to do with -- let's go to 5 the interpretations. Joe, take a look at 6 the code as it relates to interpretations. 7 I have not had a conversation with the 8 Town Attorney on this issue. Section 9 185-54 A, powers and duties of the 10 ZBA relative to interpretations, to 11 determine on appeal, the Board 12 requires a decision or determination 13 made by an administrative official on 14 the following matters. The meaning 15 of any portion of the text of this 16 chapter, Section 185, or of any condition 17 or requirement specified or made 18 under the provisions of this chapter. 19 This chapter being Section 185 of the 20 Zoning which would cover 185-48.3, 21 but not the other two sections that I 22 cited before.

23 MR. JOHNSON: It's my understanding 24 that this was 185 only, but I do see the 25 A and the B. There's a period after the
2	actual "Please take notice." I don't
3	know what the A and the B are there for.
4	MR. DONOVAN: I think those are the
5	allegations, working without a permit.
6	MR. JOHNSON: Yeah, but it's the
7	violations observed on the parcel are as
8	follows. It was observed on $8/27/24$ that
9	work in progress without the required
10	building permit and no application was
11	submitted. The work being performed was
12	rebuilding a deck adjoined to a new dock
13	being built out over the water. Besides
14	local and state codes governing
15	construction permits, approval from the
16	NYS DEC, Town Zoning Board and an
17	engineer's design may be required.
18	There's a period at that point.
19	MS. REIN: Was there a preexisting
20	dock?
21	MR. JOHNSON: Yes. Long ago. Long
22	ago.
23	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Does this dock
24	come out in the winter?
25	MR. JOHNSON: The point is so it

2	won't have to come out. It can come out.
3	The idea of the crib is so you don't have
4	to remove it every year. The one that
5	was there before unfortunately got
6	demolished one of the winters. Not this
7	immediate past winter, but the winter
8	before that.
9	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The cribbing that
10	you're discussing, is there a standard
11	design for that?
12	MR. JOHNSON: Well, it's basically
13	a piece of plywood, four posts coming up,
14	tied with boards going around it to hold
15	rock.
16	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. And that
17	can sustain what type of load?
18	MR. JOHNSON: They're 4 by 4s.
19	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. So I think
20	I'm going to go back to the comments from
21	the Building Department for an engineer's
22	certification of what it is you're
23	building can hold people. Not that
24	you're going to have eighteen people
25	dancing on your deck, but are you sure

2	they could if they wanted to?
3	MR. JOHNSON: I don't think it
4	would hold that many people. Other than
5	that, yeah, it's solid.
6	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: All right.
7	MR. JOHNSON: I understand.
8	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm a
9	professional engineer, that's why I'm
10	asking you these pointed questions. As
11	an engineer, there's a public safety
12	factor. Any building structure needs to
13	be built in accordance with standards.
14	Standards are developed to preserve life
15	and limb. What I'm getting out of this
16	is that's not what you did.
17	MR. JOHNSON: Well, I'm not sure
18	that that's totally accurate. I mean
19	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'd love to hear
20	your interpretation of where I'm wrong.
21	MR. JOHNSON: Well, I mean, what I
22	did do was look for a crib crib plans
23	and cribbing diagrams and cribbing
24	information.
25	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Based on New York

2 State standards or is this Building Code 3 standards? Where did you get this 4 information? 5 Actually, I'm sorry. Let me back 6 We'll get to that section a little up. 7 bit later, because I think you and I 8 could go back and forth probably for 9 another twenty minutes. 10 Let me open it up to the other 11 Members of the Board for any questions 12 that they may have. I think you get an 13 idea of my position here and the way I'm 14 looking at this. It's a safety factor to 15 me, which I don't know that -- again, it 16 might -- it felt fine when I walked on 17 it. I don't know anything more than 18 that. 19 I'm going to go down to Ms. Rein. 20 MS. REIN: I agree with you. I 21 have no questions. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Masten? 23 MR. MASTEN: Not really right at 24 this time. 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Hermance?

2	MR. HERMANCE: I think the point
3	also, if you had obtained a permit and
4	consulted with the building inspector, a
5	design could have been agreed upon for
6	the proper cribbing for design for New
7	York State live loads and dead loads and
8	things like that.
9	MR. JOHNSON: I mean, I understand
10	that that would be possible. As I read
11	the ordinance, no building permit is
12	required for a dock.
13	MR. HERMANCE: Maybe a floating
14	dock perhaps.
15	MR. JOHNSON: Whether it's cribbed
16	or floating or on pillars, which of
17	course it is not. I mean, that was the
18	problem I had the last time, it was on
19	stakes into the ground. It was a mistake
20	to leave it in the water.
21	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Eberhart?
22	MR. EBERHART: I'm in full
23	agreement with you, Mr. Chairman. This
24	is a safety issue. I'm a codes and
25	standards person. You need a building

2

permit.

3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Mattina. 4 MR. MATTINA: If you go to 185-48.3 5 I(5), "All such docks and docking or mooring shall also comply with all other 6 7 applicable Town local laws and 8 ordinances," which kicks it 71-A which 9 says you need a building permit if it's a 10 structure. 11 MR. JOHNSON: I think that's a 12 misreading of that statute. It says all 13 docks shall conform. It doesn't say the 14 permit application. There's no 15 requirement for a permit. It just says the docks shall conform. 16 17 That's not true. MR. MATTINA: 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: What source are 19 you relying on for your conformance? 20 You? 21 MR. JOHNSON: I'm an attorney. 22 Yes. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm an engineer. 24 We've established that. So who do you 25 think could build a better structure, you

2

or me?

3 MR. JOHNSON: You. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you. 5 MR. JOHNSON: I have no question. 6 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I hope you see 7 where I'm going here. There's a safety 8 issue here, that it needs to be built in conformance with New York State standards 9 10 or Building Code standards. We don't 11 know that it is. 12 MR. JOHNSON: There's also a 13 requirement that the statute require it. 14 As I read that statute, it does not 15 require it. I can be wrong. 16 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Which is why 17 you're here for an interpretation. We 18 are the Board with the authority to tell 19 you whether or not you do or not. Again, 20 I apologize, we should -- you and I could 21 talk for hours about this. 22 At this point I'd like to open it 23 up to any members of the public that wish 24 to comment on this application. 25 (No response.)

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I thought we 3 would have had one or two at least. 4 All right. I quess we'll --5 Counsel, as an interpretation, I don't 6 know, are we going through --7 MR. DONOVAN: For an interpretation 8 you do not go through the five factors. 9 We've done this on occasion in the past. 10 The question being asked -- essentially 11 you're asking the Board -- you want an 12 interpretation. 13 That's correct. MR. JOHNSON: 14 MR. DONOVAN: The Board could then 15 say based upon the evidence -- we're not 16 in court, but based upon the information 17 submitted, someone could make a motion to 18 either grant the interpretation as 19 requested, no building permit is required 20 for the dock, or you could deny the 21 interpretation and uphold the 22 determination of the Building Department. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you, 24 Counsel. 25 I'm going to go back to the Board.

45 1 Kurt E. Johnson 2 Discussion here? 3 MS. REIN: No. I think it's all 4 pretty clear. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. Mr. Masten, 6 are you in alignment with that --7 MR. MASTEN: I'm in alignment. 8 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: -- or are you on the fence? 9 10 MR. MASTEN: I'm agreeing. 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Hermance? 12 MR. HERMANCE: Yes. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Eberhart? 13 14 MR. EBERHART: Yes. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: If you've got a 16 compelling flip side to that --17 MR. JOHNSON: No. It was my 18 interpretation that no building permit 19 was required. That's why we got here and 20 that's why I presented it to you to make 21 the determination. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you. I 23 know why you landed here. It had to do with the Building Department's 24 25 interpretation as well.

2	Moving forward, Counsel. Someone
3	makes a motion for or against the
4	interpretation?
5	MR. DONOVAN: If I sense the Board
6	correctly I don't vote. If I sense
7	correctly, you want to uphold the
8	Building Department's determination. The
9	motion would be to deny the interpretation
10	request and uphold the interpretation of
11	the Building Department that a building
12	permit is required for the dock.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you.
14	I'm good with numbers, he's great
15	with words.
16	MR. DONOVAN: We go to school for
17	that.
18	MS. REIN: We have to close the
19	hearing.
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That, too.
21	MR. DONOVAN: You didn't ask me
22	that.
23	MS. REIN: I'll make a motion to
24	close the public hearing.
25	MR. EBERHART: I'll second it.

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 3 to close the public hearing from Ms. Rein. 4 We have a second from Mr. Eberhart. 5 All in favor. 6 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 7 MR. HERMANCE: Aye. 8 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 9 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 10 MS. REIN: Aye. 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed? 12 (No response.) 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you. I was 14 getting lost. Very good. 15 So now, having heard the 16 information provided to us, does the 17 Board have a motion regarding the 18 interpretation? 19 MR. HERMANCE: I'll make a motion 20 to deny the request and uphold the Town's --21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Code Compliance's 22 23 position. 24 MR. EBERHART: I'll second it.

25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion

48 1 Kurt E. Johnson 2 from Mr. Hermance. We have a second from 3 Mr. Eberhart. 4 Can you roll on that, please, 5 Siobhan. 6 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart? 7 MR. EBERHART: Yes. 8 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance? 9 MR. HERMANCE: Yes. MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten? 10 11 MR. MASTEN: Yes. 12 MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein? 13 MS. REIN: Yes. 14 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo? 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm also 16 affirmative. 17 Sir, in this instance your 18 interpretation has been found to be in 19 favor of the Code Compliance Department. 20 We see it their way. 21 MR. JOHNSON: Thank you. 22 (Time noted: 7:34 p.m.) 23 24 25

1	Kurt E. Johnson
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	
24	
25	

1			
2	STATE OF NEW YC TOWN OF NEWBURGH		OUNTY OF ORANGE
3			X
4	In the Matter of		
5	זיחיד ד	E BRITE S	TCNS
6			
7	Section 8	te 17K, N 9; Block IB Zone	
8	-		
9			X
10		Date	October 24, 2024
11		Time: Place:	7:34 p.m.
12		TTACE.	Town Hall 1496 Route 300
13			Newburgh, New York
14			
15	BOARD MEMBERS:		SCALZO, Chairman SERHART, JR.
16			M. HERMANCE
17		DONNA RE	
18	ALCO DDECEME.		
19	ALSO PRESENT:	JOSEPH N	DNOVAN, ESQ. MATTINA JABLESNIK
20		SIOBHAN	JABLESNIK
21	APPLICANT'S REPRES	SENTATIVE	: MARIA ROTUNDO
22			
23			X
24		irt Report	ter
25		45)541-41	

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Our next 3 application is Lite Brite Signs, 226 4 Route 17K in Newburgh. This is a 5 Planning Board referral for area 6 variances of square footage for the 7 proposed total building-mounted signs and 8 the setback of a freestanding sign for Sunbelt Rentals. 9 10 Do we have mailings on this, 11 Siobhan? 12 MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent 13 15 mailings. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 15 mailings. 15 Who do we have with us? 16 MS. ROTUNDO: I'm Maria Rotundo 17 with Lite Brite Signs. I'm representing 18 Sunbelt Rentals. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. 20 Google Maps turned me around. I was heading one way and it made me turn into 21 22 Corporate plaza and turn around. I had 23 to take a right into that parking lot. I 24 definitely didn't like that one bit. 25 Anyway, I know I only mentioned

2 your application in one sentence. We've 3 been to the site. Is there any flavor 4 you'd like to add? 5 MS. ROTUNDO: You see how the site 6 is long and thin, so most of the linear 7 frontage is to the side elevation because 8 of the way the property is. The code 9 goes by linear frontage. We're allowed 10 60 square feet. We have a huge building. 11 It's just situated where the short end is 12 facing the front. 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. 14 MS. ROTUNDO: I think that's a 15 disadvantage for us with the square 16 footage. 17 Also, we do have a lot of negative 18 space with the building-mounted signs. 19 If you look at sign A, that goes on the 20 front, which is the short linear 21 frontage, the 60 linear frontage, sign A. 22 If you look at the layout of that sign, 23 you have their logo on top and then the 24 letters below. If you get rid of all the 25 negative space, it's really 40 square

2 feet. With the negative space, if you 3 draw a square around the whole sign --4 does that make sense, the way I'm 5 presenting it? CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's how the 6 7 code interprets it as far as I know. 8 MS. ROTUNDO: I'm just saying that 9 there is a lot of negative space. If the 10 Board could just take that into consideration, that would be great. 11 12 Also, the monument sign. The 13 asphalt is right there, so we don't have 14 much space. We're asking for a 5-foot 15 setback. We don't think that's going to 16 be a detriment or a hazard. It's only 12 17 foot high, the monument. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I turned around 19 in the parking lot and I looked at 20 things. What I didn't pay attention to 21 is similar signs around you. 22 Did any of you folks? 23 No, because it sits MR. HERMANCE: 24 back. 25 MS. ROTUNDO: There's not that

2	many. The airport I mean, Stewart is
3	right there. It's kind of not really
4	built up commercially.
5	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Just so I
6	understand what you're saying, you're
7	looking for your sign to be 5 feet off
8	the right-of-way?
9	MS. ROTUNDO: 5 foot. It's a
10	15-foot setback we're supposed to have.
11	We're asking for 5. If you look at the
12	depiction, there was a huge sign in the
13	same area.
14	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The old landscape
15	building.
16	MS. ROTUNDO: I'm sorry?
17	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The old landscape
18	building.
19	MR. MASTEN: That property, Darrin,
20	it was a nursery.
21	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Right.
22	MS. ROTUNDO: I think it's an
23	improvement. We got rid of the other
24	structure.
25	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. I don't

2	have a lot. That's quite the commercial
3	area, and it's not on top of a lot of
4	stuff. I really don't our sign
5	ordinance, I think we're trying to take
6	care of that with the comprehensive plan.
7	Not that that takes care of your space
8	that's around the actual sign.
9	I don't have a lot to add to this
10	application.
11	Mr. Eberhart?
12	MR. EBERHART: No.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: How about you,
14	Mr. Hermance?
15	MR. HERMANCE: I have nothing. No
16	questions.
17	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Masten?
18	MR. MASTEN: Nothing.
19	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Ms. Rein?
20	MS. REIN: I'm good.
21	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Is there anyone
22	here, members of the public, that wish to
23	speak about this application?
24	(No response.)
25	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It does not

56 1 Lite Brite Signs 2 appear so. 3 All right. Back to the Board. 4 Anything? 5 MR. DONOVAN: This is an Unlisted action. 6 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: This is an 8 Unlisted action under SEQRA. If the 9 Board is going to make a motion to 10 approve this application, then we need also a motion for a negative declaration. 11 12 You folks understand, fellow Members, 13 that someone needs to make a motion for a 14 negative declaration, it needs to be 15 seconded and we need to move from there. 16 MR. HERMANCE: Do we need to close 17 the public hearing before that? 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I am dropping the 19 ball with closing the public hearings 20 tonight. 21 Thanks, Mr. Hermance. 22 A motion to close the public 23 hearing. 24 MR. HERMANCE: I'll make that 25 motion.

57 1 Lite Brite Signs 2 MR. EBERHART: Second. 3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you, Mr. 4 Hermance. We have a second from 5 Mr. Eberhart. All in favor. MR. EBERHART: 6 Ave. 7 MR. HERMANCE: Aye. 8 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 9 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 10 MS. REIN: Aye. 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed? 12 (No response.) CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Now we're going 13 to move on to the Unlisted action under 14 15 SEQRA. Again, I'm looking for a motion 16 for a negative declaration from someone. 17 MS. REIN: I'll make a motion for a 18 negative declaration. 19 MR. MASTEN: I'll second it. 20 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 21 for a negative declaration from Ms. Rein. 22 We have a second from Mr. Masten. All in 23 favor. 24 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 25 MR. HERMANCE: Aye.

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 3 MR. MASTEN: Ave. 4 MS. REIN: Aye. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed? 6 (No response.) 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. Now 8 we can move on. In this instance here, 9 we're still going to go through the five 10 factors of the balancing tests, the first 11 one being whether or not the benefit can 12 be achieved by other means feasible to 13 the applicant. Sure, if they reduce the 14 Then they wouldn't get the notice signs. 15 they're looking to get. 16 Second, if there's an undesirable 17 change in the neighborhood character or a 18 detriment to nearby properties. 19 MR. EBERHART: No. 20 MR. HERMANCE: No. 21 MR. MASTEN: No. 22 MS. REIN: No. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It kind of fits with exactly what's going on there. 24 25 The third, whether the request is

2 substantial. By the numbers it is. 3 Are you married to that 5-foot offset off the right-of-way line? 4 5 Without it being up, it's difficult to 6 see if it would even be anything in the 7 line of sight for anybody. I believe 8 you're going to go out past it anyway 9 when you're trying to pull out of the 10 parking lot. 11 MS. ROTUNDO: Yeah. It's only 12 12 foot high. Can I say we could do 10 feet 13 if there's room without disturbing the asphalt? 14 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. Let's get 16 to the end of this. 17 MS. ROTUNDO: Can we do that, where 18 we could place it farther back if we can? 19 MR. DONOVAN: The problem that you 20 run into when you say that, if that can't 21 happen, then Code Compliance is left with 22 what do we do with this, because it's 23 unclear. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Right. 25 MR. DONOVAN: I would just suggest,

2	if the Board is okay with it, you give
3	them the 5 feet and request that, if
4	they can, move it back further. You do
5	the reverse.
6	MS. ROTUNDO: Yes.
7	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We're getting a
8	nod, which Michelle can't pick up.
9	MS. ROTUNDO: I agree. Do you know
10	that site? What do you think? Have you
11	been there?
12	MR. MATTINA: I've never been there.
13	MS. ROTUNDO: Okay.
14	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Counsel, great
15	idea. Very good.
16	The substantial, that's the one we
17	just went through.
18	The fourth, whether the request will
19	have adverse physical or environmental
20	effects. It does not appear so.
21	The fifth, whether the alleged
22	difficulty is self-created, which of
23	course it is.
24	If the Board approves, it shall
25	grant the minimum variance necessary

2	and may impose reasonable conditions.
3	I believe this is where Counsel's
4	wonderful idea of we go ahead and move
5	with the 5 foot. That's the only one
6	that concerned me. You folks may feel
7	differently. We grant it for the 5,
8	but the applicant has indicated they
9	will do what they can to kick it back
10	a little bit.
11	If anybody could
12	MS. REIN: Let's close it first,
13	if we're ready.
14	I'll make a motion to close the
15	public hearing.
16	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Did I not do that?
17	I thought Greg Hermance got me on that.
18	So the winner that you have is now no
19	longer a winner. You were one up on
20	me, Donna.
21	Since the public hearing is closed,
22	what we're looking at is, does the Board
23	have a motion of some sort?
24	MR. HERMANCE: I'll make a motion
25	to approve the 5-foot setback.

62 1 Lite Brite Signs 2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We're approving 3 them all, Mr. Hermance. 4 MR. HERMANCE: Right. However, 5 with the request --6 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The request for 7 the right-of-way setback. We will give 8 the 5. If the applicant can kick it back, that would be --9 10 MR. HERMANCE: To 10. 11 MS. ROTUNDO: Could I mention 12 something? 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Absolutely. 14 MS. ROTUNDO: If you look at page 2, we show the line, that it's 25 feet, 15 16 the sign, to the white line on the road. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: When you say page 18 2, I have like thirty pages back. 19 MS. ROTUNDO: All right. 20 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Oh, I was looking at the right one to begin with. You're 21 22 29 feet from the fog line. 23 MS. ROTUNDO: Is that what that's 24 called? 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The white line,

2 the fog line. 3 MS. ROTUNDO: Okay. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 24. 5 MS. ROTUNDO: That's what I'm There's no hazard if it would 6 saying. 7 fall. 8 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Again, the motion just came out as leave it where it is. 9 10 If you could kick it back --11 MS. ROTUNDO: We could post it. We 12 could, you know, mark it maybe and Joe can come look, if you'd like. 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That sounds 14 15 wonderful. 16 MR. DONOVAN: He would prefer we 17 just tell him what to do I think. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It works the same way in my house, Joe. So there we have it. 19 20 I believe we had a motion from Mr. Hermance. Did we have a second 21 22 on that? 23 MS. REIN: I'll second. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Roll on that, 25 Siobhan.

64 1 Lite Brite Signs 2 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart? 3 MR. EBERHART: Yes. 4 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance? 5 MR. HERMANCE: Yes. 6 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten? 7 MR. MASTEN: Yes. 8 MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein? 9 MS. REIN: Yes. MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo? 10 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. 12 The motion is carried. The 13 variances are approved. 14 Please work with the Building 15 Department for any adjustments you may 16 need. 17 MS. ROTUNDO: Okay. Also, I think 18 -- if you could let me know tonight. Ιf 19 not, I can call the Planning Board. Do I 20 go back to the Planning Board now? 21 MS. JABLESNIK: Yes. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. 23 MS. ROTUNDO: Okay. Thank you. 24 Good night. 25 (Time noted: 7:48 p.m.)

1	Lite Brite Signs
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	MICHELLE CONERO
24	
25	

1			
2	STATE OF NEW YORK : COUNTY OF ORANGE TOWN OF NEWBURGH ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS		
3	X		
4	In the Matter of		
5			BUYER, LLC
6			
7	102 Fern Avenue, Newburgh Section 67; Block 8; Lot 2 R-3 Zone		
8	1		
9			X
10		Dato.	October 24, 2024
11		Time: Place:	7:48 p.m.
12		riace.	Town Hall
13			1496 Route 300 Newburgh, New York
14			
15	BOARD MEMBERS:		SCALZO, Chairman SERHART, JR.
16			M. HERMANCE
17		DONNA RE	
18			
19	ALSO PRESENT:	DAVID DONOVAN, ESQ. JOSEPH MATTINA SIOBHAN JABLESNIK	
20		STODIAN	UADLESNIK
21	APPLICANT'S REPRES	SENTATIVE	: TAYLOR BERG
22			
23	X MICHELLE L. CONERO Court Reporter Michelleconero@hotmail.com		
24			
25		45)541-41	

1	Capital Property Buyer, LLC 67
2	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Our next
3	applicant is Capital Property Buyer, LLC,
4	102 Fern Avenue. They're seeking area
5	variances of, A, the minimum front yard
6	setback to keep a multi-level deck built
7	without permits; and B, the combined side
8	yards to build a 10 by 20 rear deck.
9	Do we have mailings on this,
10	Siobhan?
11	MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent
12	46 letters.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 46.
14	MS. JABLESNIK: Winner, winner.
15	Not winner.
16	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Who do we have
17	with us?
18	MR. BERG: My name is Taylor Berg.
19	I own Capital Property Buyers.
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That is, in this
21	instance, your property?
22	MR. BERG: Yup.
23	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I was just there
24	today. That's quite the hill. If I've
25	captured everything that it is you're

1 Capital Property Buyer, LLC

it.

looking for here in those two sentences, we can move on. If you want to add some color commentary, feel free. MR. BERG: No. I think you got it. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You think I got If I could just remember to close the public hearings, that would be great. Very good. As I say, I drove by. Let me ask, you just want to keep that front deck? You want to maybe replace any bad boards or something like that? You want to keep it exactly as it

14 is?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15 MR. BERG: Yeah. So the decks were built in 1970. I bought the house seven 16 17 months ago. I just wanted to replace the 18 decks. I just wanted to actually redo 19 them both.

20 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You're not 21 enlarging them from what we currently 22 saw?

23 MR. BERG: No.

24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: All right. I've 25 got nothing then.

69 1 Capital Property Buyer, LLC 2 Ms. Rein? 3 MS. REIN: No. 4 MR. MASTEN: I have nothing. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Hermance? 6 MR. HERMANCE: You mean you'll just 7 replace the deckboards on the existing 8 deck or are you replacing the structure? MR. BERG: The structure, too. 9 Ιt 10 was built a long time ago so it's got 11 little 4 by 4s, the steps aren't even. 12 MR. HERMANCE: You're going to demo 13 that and build one to current codes? 14 MR. BERG: Yes. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Utilizing the 16 same footprint, which gives our Code 17 Compliance guys the opportunity to ensure 18 that it's built to New York State 19 Building Code. That's a great idea. That's all I have. 20 MR. HERMANCE: 21 Mr. Eberhart? CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 22 MR. EBERHART: I have nothing. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: At this point 24 I'll open it up to any members that want 25 to speak from the public.

70 1 Capital Property Buyer, LLC 2 (No response.) 3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: One last look at 4 the Board. 5 (No response.) CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'll look to the 6 Board for a motion to close the public 7 8 hearing. MR. MASTEN: I'll make a motion to 9 10 close the public hearing. 11 MS. REIN: I'll second it. 12 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 13 from Mr. Masten. We have a second from 14 Ms. Rein. All those in favor. 15 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 16 MR. HERMANCE: Aye. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 18 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 19 MS. REIN: Aye. 20 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed? 21 (No response.) 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: This is a Type 2 23 action under SEQRA, so we are going to go 24 through our five factors, the first one 25 being whether or not the benefit can be

1	Capital Property Buyer, LLC 71
2	achieved by other means feasible to the
3	applicant.
4	MS. REIN: No.
5	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Second, if
6	there's an undesirable change to the
7	neighborhood character or a detriment to
8	nearby properties.
9	MR. EBERHART: No.
10	MR. HERMANCE: No.
11	MR. MASTEN: No.
12	MS. REIN: No.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: No. It's going
14	to be replaced in kind, just better.
15	Third, whether the request is
16	substantial. I guess by the numbers you
17	could say so. Because it's preexisting
18	nonconforming, probably not.
19	Fourth, whether the request will
20	have adverse physical or environmental
21	effects. It does not appear so.
22	The fifth, whether the alleged
23	difficulty is self-created, which is
24	relevant but not determinative. It's
25	self-created maybe for the rear deck.

1	Capital Property Buyer, LLC 72
2	The front deck, you inherited that.
3	Having gone through the balancing
4	tests for the area variance, does the
5	Board have a motion of some sort?
6	MR. HERMANCE: I'll make a motion
7	to approve.
8	MR. EBERHART: Second.
9	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion
10	for approval from Mr. Hermance. I think
11	I heard from Mr. Eberhart.
12	Can you roll on that, please,
13	Siobhan.
14	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart?
15	MR. EBERHART: Yes.
16	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance?
17	MR. HERMANCE: Yes.
18	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten?
19	MR. MASTEN: Yes.
20	MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein?
21	MS. REIN: Yes.
22	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo?
23	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes.
24	The motion is carried and the
25	variances are approved. Good luck, sir.
Capital Property Buyer, LLC MR. BERG: I've dealt with a lot of zoning boards and building departments. You are really organized and it was really nice. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It's these two. They keep me straight. MR. BERG: Thanks. MR. DONOVAN: You can't imagine how much that means today. MS. JABLESNIK: It really does. I will go to work tomorrow. (Time noted: 7:54 p.m.)

1	Capital Property Buyer, LLC
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	MICUPTTE CONFRO
24	
25	

1		75
2	STATE OF NEW YORK :	
3	TOWN OF NEWBURGH ZONIN	X
4	In the Matter of	
5		
6	CHRISTOPHE	
7	111 North Dix Ave Section 71; Bloc R-3 Zor	k 8; Lot 4.2
8	IX 5 201	16
9		X
10		
11	Time:	October 24, 2024 7:54 p.m.
12	Place	Town Hall
13		1496 Route 300 Newburgh, New York
14		
15		N SCALZO, Chairman EBERHART, JR.
16	GREGO	RY M. HERMANCE MASTEN
17		REIN
18		
19	JOSEP	DONOVAN, ESQ. H MATTINA
20	STORH	AN JABLESNIK
21	APPLICANT'S REPRESENTATI	VE: CHRISTOPHER LLORAY
22		
23		X
24	MICHELLE L. Court Rep	orter
25	Michelleconero@ (845)541	

76 1 Christopher Lloray 2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Our next 3 applicant is Christopher Lloray, I hope 4 I said that right, --5 MR. LLORAY: Yes. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: -- at 111 North 6 7 Dix Avenue, seeking an area variance of 8 maximum square footage of accessory 9 structures to build a 24 by 24 addition 10 onto an existing 14 by 24 accessory 11 building. 12 Do we have mailings on this, Siobhan? 13 14 MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent 15 54 letters. He is the winner. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I think he might 16 17 have done it twice. 18 MS. JABLESNIK: Poor quy. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I think you did. 20 Funny story. If anybody got it two times 21 here, that's why. 22 I happened to drive by today. It 23 happens to be very close to my house. I'm 24 going to guess that you want to go on 25 that concrete pad that's already there.

77 1 Christopher Lloray MR. LLORAY: Unfortunately my 2 3 cousin did that. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. The building is not up yet, you know. Who 5 knows. Maybe you like basketball and you 6 7 wanted a concrete basketball court with 8 the thing sticking up out of it. I 9 really don't have much to say about that. 10 It's not like hugging the side yard or anything like that. 11 12 I'm going to start on my right side. Mr. Eberhart? 13 14 MR. EBERHART: I have nothing. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: How about you, 16 Mr. Hermance? 17 MR. HERMANCE: It's not really 18 visible. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Well, it is but 19 20 it's not. It's kind of -- you almost 21 need to have business in that 22 neighborhood to be on your street. 23 Mr. Masten? 24 MR. MASTEN: I have no questions. 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Ms. Rein?

78 1 Christopher Lloray 2 MS. REIN: No. Nothing. 3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Are there any members of the public that wish to speak 4 5 about this application? 6 (No response.) 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: No. I'll look to 8 the Board for a motion to close the 9 public hearing. MR. MASTEN: I'll make a motion to 10 11 close the public hearing. 12 MS. REIN: Second. 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 14 from Mr. Masten. We have a second from 15 Ms. Rein. All in favor. 16 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 17 MR. HERMANCE: Aye. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 19 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 20 MS. REIN: Aye. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed? 22 (No response.) 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: This is a Type 2 24 action under SEQRA. You've heard us all 25 night. The first one, whether or not the

1 Christopher Lloray

2 benefit can be achieved by other means 3 feasible to the applicant. 4 MS. REIN: No. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The second, if there's an undesirable change in the 6 7 neighborhood character or a detriment to 8 nearby properties. It does not appear 9 so. I think once the garage is up, some 10 of the things will end up in the garage. Third, whether the request is 11 12 substantial. By the numbers, I suppose with the side yard. This is not a very 13 14 big garage. 15 Fourth, whether the request will have 16 adverse physical or environmental effects. 17 MR. EBERHART: No. 18 MR. HERMANCE: No. 19 MR. MASTEN: No. 20 MS. REIN: No. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I don't think so. 22 The fifth, whether the alleged 23 difficulty is self-created, which of 24 course it is. 25 With regard to the character of the

1 Christopher Lloray

2	neighborhood, there are a lot of detached
3	garages in that area. Again, it wouldn't
4	be out of character.
5	Having gone through the balancing
6	tests of the area variance, does the
7	Board have a motion of some sort?
8	MS. REIN: I'll make a motion to
9	approve.
10	MR. HERMANCE: Second.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion
12	for approval from Ms. Rein. We have a
13	second from Mr. Hermance.
14	Can you roll on that, please, Siobhan.
15	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart?
16	MR. EBERHART: Yes.
17	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance?
18	MR. HERMANCE: Yes.
19	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten?
20	MR. MASTEN: Yes.
21	MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein?
22	MS. REIN: Yes.
23	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo?
24	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes.
25	The motion is carried. The

1 Christopher Lloray 2 variances are approved. Good luck. 3 Thank you for your MR. LLORAY: 4 time. 5 (Time noted: 8:00 p.m.) 6 7 CERTIFICATION 8 9 I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public 10 for and within the State of New York, do hereby certify: 11 12 That hereinbefore set forth is a true 13 record of the proceedings. 14 I further certify that I am not 15 related to any of the parties to this 16 proceeding by blood or by marriage and that 17 I am in no way interested in the outcome of 18 this matter. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto 19 20 set my hand this 31st day of October 2024. 21 22 Michelle Conero 23 MICHELLE CONERO 24 25

1				82
2	STATE OF NEW YOU TOWN OF NEWBURGH			
3		20NING E	X	
4	In the Matter of			
5	DICII	ard cavei	TEDO	
6		-	-	
7	11 Copper Section 125			
8		1 20110		
9			X	
10			October 24, 2024	
11		Time: Place:	8:00 p.m. Town of Newburgh	
12		I LUCE.	Town Hall 1496 Route 300	
13			Newburgh, New York	
14				
15	BOARD MEMBERS:		CALZO, Chairman ERHART, JR.	
16			M. HERMANCE	
17		DONNA RE		
18	ALSO PRESENT:		NOVAN ESO	
19	ALSO FRESENT.	JOSEPH M	NOVAN, ESQ. ATTINA JABLESNIK	
20		STODUMN	OADLESNIK	
21	APPLICANT'S REPRESE	ENTATIVES	CAVELLERO	SA
22				
23		 Lle l. CC	X	
24		rt Report	er	
25		5)541-41		

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Our next 3 applicant this evening is Richard 4 Cavellero, 11 Copper Rock Road, 5 seeking area variances of maximum building height, square footage and 6 storage of vehicles to build a 36 7 8 foot by 40 foot by 25 foot high 9 detached accessory building. 10 Siobhan, do we have mailings on 11 this? 12 MS. JABLESNIK: This applicant sent 13 30 letters. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. Who 15 do we have with us? 16 MR. CAVELLERO: Richard Cavellero 17 and my wife Marissa. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very nice to meet 19 you. I'm glad you guys made it out 20 tonight. I was through your neighborhood. 21 It's a great neighborhood. 22 MS. CAVELLERO: I agree. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It's very nice. 24 Relatively new, too. Probably within ten 25 years. Something like that.

2 As I saw, you already have a three-3 car garage on your house. I saw a couple 4 of cars in the driveway. I see where you 5 want to do this. I also drove around your neighborhood. 6 7 What you're asking for, I don't know if 8 you've noticed this, no one else has that. 9 I think the biggest shed I saw in that 10 entire neighborhood was probably a 12 by 15 shed, if that. This thing is like house 11 12 size. That's just my observation. 13 MS. CAVELLERO: He would live in 14 there with all of his cars. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I read the 16 application. The application indicates 17 that you inherited some classic vehicles 18 and you're just looking for protection of 19 those. 20 MR. CAVELLERO: Right. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. I stated 22 that one sentence of what you're looking 23 We had a little bit of dialogue for. 24 back and forth. Do you have anything 25 that you want to add before I open it up

2

to the Board Members?

3 MR. CAVELLERO: We have a three-car 4 garage now. The first bay is shallow. 5 It's mostly for storage. You can't fit a 6 large vehicle, or any kind of vehicle. 7 The other two bays, one is for her and 8 one for me. We're looking for more 9 storage. 10 MS. CAVELLERO: He has collectible vehicles as well. Just having that 11 12 storage on our property rather than 13 having to, you know, go and put it in 14 storage elsewhere makes more sense. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I wish I could 16 collect classic cars. I understand the

17 need for space. Everybody's got stuff.

18 MR. CAVELLERO: Right.

19CHAIRMAN SCALZO: People should be20forced to move every five years so they21can clear out.

Anyway, that's neither here nor there. As I say, my observation of the neighborhood was that no one else has what you're asking for. That's where I'm

86 1 Richard Cavellero 2 sitting. 3 I'm going to look down to Mr. 4 Eberhart. Mr. Eberhart, do you have any 5 comments regarding this application? 6 MR. EBERHART: You make a very good 7 point. It would be somewhat out of 8 character with the neighborhood. My 9 expectation is -- how many letters were 10 sent out again? 11 MS. JABLESNIK: 30. 30 letters. 12 MR. EBERHART: We don't have anyone 13 here. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm glad you said 15 that, Mr. Eberhart. The Zoning Board 16 office did receive some phone calls. 17 Then, I don't know, a few years back 18 there was, I don't know if it was a 19 formal complaint or just an observation 20 regarding -- I guess you like to do the 21 work on the cars yourself. 22 MR. CAVELLERO: Not all the time. 23 It's a hobby basically. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The couple of 25 calls that did come in were that you were

1	Richard Cavellero 87
2	working on cars an awful lot in that
3	driveway.
4	That being said, we haven't opened
5	it up to the public yet. There has been
6	a little bit of noise, I'll say, coming
7	into the ZBA office.
8	MR. EBERHART: Okay. I want to
9	hear if there are any comments.
10	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thanks, Mr.
11	Eberhart. That's the beauty of asking my
12	fellow Board Members what's going on.
13	I'm a ten-year Board Member and I've
14	been, for other applications, accused of
15	being the no guy.
16	When it's referred to as an
17	accessory structure, the height and/or
18	maximum building height Mr. Mattina,
19	help me out is 15 feet in this
20	instance?
21	MR. MATTINA: Yes.
22	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The applicant is
23	looking for 25.
24	MR. CAVELLERO: We're going to take
25	5 foot off the top. We'll omit the

cupola.

2

3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The cupola? 4 MR. CAVELLERO: Yes. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You're looking at 20 then. The cupola was 5? I thought it 6 7 was 3. Okay. I always get nervous when 8 an applicant comes in with a building 9 that that's high, because the ability to 10 put a second story -- not a second story, 11 a second floor can end up being habitable 12 space, and that ends up being an issue. The other thing that's nice about a 13 14 garage that has height inside is that you 15 can put a lift in. I get nervous when I 16 see building heights that are up there. 17 Again Mr. Eberhart, I know you 18 didn't think you were making me think of 19 other things, but you just made me think 20 of other things as you were asking your 21 question. 22 MS. CAVELLERO: If I can, --23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: This is your 24 application. 25 MS. CAVELLERO: -- the height and

2	being able to build the structure so that
3	we can store all of our Christmas items
4	and things that we aren't able to
5	currently store in our garage with our
6	growing family. All of the kid items,
7	bikes and what have you. So being able
8	to go upwards with like storage of bins
9	and things, just trying to think ahead of
10	our organization.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I understand.
12	Everybody has stuff.
13	MS. CAVELLERO: Too much.
14	MR. CAVELLERO: We have three kids.
15	More stuff.
16	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I got you.
17	Mr. Hermance?
18	MR. HERMANCE: That was going to be
19	my question. Are you planning on putting
20	in a lift?
21	MR. CAVELLERO: It's strictly for
22	storage of classic vehicles.
23	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'll tell you
24	what, Mr. Hermance. The applicant has
25	already stated that they are not looking

```
1 Richard Cavellero
```

2	for the full 25 now. I have to look at
3	the plan here, how far down it says
4	here 21.2 3/4.
5	MR. CAVELLERO: That's to the peak.
6	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's to the
7	peak. Now we're looking at 21.2 3/4
8	instead of 25.
9	Mr. Hermance, just for your
10	MR. MATTINA: If I may.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Mattina.
12	MR. MATTINA: I just learned how to
13	count. 36 by 40 is 1,440 square feet,
14	not 1,400. I forgot a 4.
15	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: What you're
16	saying is that now increases it? It may
17	have gone up a little bit?
18	MR. MATTINA: It's at 44 percent.
19	MS. CAVELLERO: 44 percent what?
20	MR. MATTINA: For the variance. 44
21	over what the code allows.
22	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 44 percent over
23	what's allowed.
24	MR. MATTINA: It went from 40 to
25	44.

1 Richard Cavellero 2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thanks, Joe. I 3 appreciate that. 4 Mr. Hermance, did we finish with 5 you? MR. HERMANCE: With lowering the 6 7 roof, it brings down the percentage for 8 the height. 9 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's correct. 10 MR. MATTINA: Yes. MR. HERMANCE: I'm not going to 11 12 figure it out, but -- that's all I had. 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. 14 Mr. Masten, did you get out there 15 to take a look in that neighborhood? 16 MR. MASTEN: I have. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It's lovely. 18 MR. MASTEN: Yes. A friend of mine 19 lost his house up there a couple years 20 ago to a fire. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I hope nobody got 22 hurt. 23 MS. CAVELLERO: No. 24 MR. MASTEN: He just moved back in 25 in July.

2	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's quite a
3	road leading up in there. I imagine if
4	they don't get to plowing it in the
5	winter fast enough, it's quite the ride.
6	MR. CAVELLERO: Up the hill is
7	impossible.
8	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Ms. Rein?
9	MS. REIN: I'm just concerned about
10	how big the structure is. As you said,
11	it's like another house on the property.
12	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The footprint is
13	big. It is.
14	MS. REIN: There's nothing around
15	there that compares to that. It will
16	definitely set a precedent and change the
17	look of the neighborhood.
18	MR. CAVELLERO: It will look nice
19	when it's done. It's not like we're
20	building a shanty or something.
21	MS. REIN: I'm sure.
22	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The neighborhood
23	would command a nice accessory structure.
24	MR. CAVELLERO: Matching siding and
25	stone and everything.

93 1 Richard Cavellero 2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Ms. Rein, any 3 other questions? 4 MS. REIN: Those are my concerns. 5 MR. MATTINA: The height was 68.3 6 percent over. It's down to 42 percent. 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Up on one, down 8 on another. 9 MR. MATTINA: I giveth and I taketh 10 away. 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: A balance right 12 there. 13 All right. I'm going to open it 14 up. Are there any members of the public 15 that wish to speak about this application? 16 MR. BAKER: I'm just a neighbor. I 17 was coming to get information. I'm very 18 happy to hear the height is --19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: If you could 20 state your name. MR. BAKER: I'm Matt Baker. I live 21 22 two or three houses down. This is my 23 daughter, Dorothy. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: She's been very 25 good tonight.

94 1 Richard Cavellero 2 MR. BAKER: The first I heard was 3 the letter. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You might have 5 been confused. They put their notice across the street on the mailbox, not in 6 7 front of the house. 8 MS. CAVELLERO: We're used to that. 9 MR. BAKER: The only thing I was 10 curious about, I know you guys said it's going to match the siding, are there like 11 12 renderings or anything like that? That I 13 quess was the thing I was curious about. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The entire 15 application is online. 16 Did this make it in there? 17 MS. JABLESNIK: Yes. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Although the exterior portions, I don't know that they 19 20 are shown. Are they? 21 MR. CAVELLERO: They're shown. 22 MS. CAVELLERO: It would be the 23 same color as the house now with like the 24 white trim, as well as then we're going 25 to put the stonework on the bottom and

2 add that to the house to kind of bring it 3 -- focus it. 4 MR. BAKER: Cool. I was just 5 curious. The neighbors next door to you, 6 I know the people just moved in and the 7 other people moved out. Have you talked 8 to them at all? What are their thoughts? 9 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: They have an 10 opportunity to be here. 11 MR. BAKER: Yeah. The neighbors 12 right next door are like brand new. Т 13 don't know if you guys have had a chance 14 to talk to them. 15 MS. CAVELLERO: I have. T've 16 spoken with Sam next door and he speaks 17 to Vinnie on the other side of us because 18 it more directly affects them. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Everybody knows 19 20 Vinnie except for me. What's Vinnie's 21 last name? 22 MS. CAVELLERO: Vincent Biele or --23 I think it's Biele. And Samantha. She 24 just moved in. I don't know her last 25 name yet. We did speak with them. We

2 wanted to be very open, we knew the 3 posting was going out, just to make sure 4 that we're not intruding on anyone's 5 vision or line of sight, trying to be 6 really open with that. 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: There's a 8 conservation easement behind you. Ι 9 noticed that on the plan. 10 MR. CAVELLERO: Yup. 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Again, I myself, 12 I struggle with it. Because you're the 13 first ones that want to do this, what 14 happens is we, as a Board, need to be 15 careful with what we do, because once we 16 set a precedent, everybody wants it and 17 maybe wants to push the limits a little 18 That's why we kind of walk a fine more. 19 line with what we look at. 20 MS. CAVELLERO: Yeah. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Is there anyone 22 else from the public that wishes to speak 23 about this application? 24 (No response.) 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm going to go

2 back to the Board. Any other discussion? 3 MR. MASTEN: I have nothing. 4 MS. REIN: No. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You just heard in the application before, I was asking the 6 7 applicant if they were -- I said married 8 to a certain number they were going to be 9 offset from the right-of-way line to the sign. As a Board, we can grant the 10 11 minimum variance that we think is 12 appropriate. Obviously you're asking for 13 what you're asking for, which is a three-14 car garage that's 21 plus or minus feet 15 off the ground, even though you mentioned 16 that it's going to have an aesthetically 17 pleasing exterior. What's the smallest 18 you can live with? That is tremendous in 19 size.

20 MR. CAVELLERO: I know I would want 21 to keep the width. I'm negotiable on the 22 length, the depth of it.

23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. Throw a24 number at me.

25 MR. CAVELLERO: If it's 40 by 36

98 1 Richard Cavellero 2 now, what do you think? 3 MS. CAVELLERO: I'll pull it up on 4 the plans. 5 MR. CAVELLERO: Would 30 feet be --6 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I don't know. 7 Mr. Mattina, help me out. I don't 8 have my calculator. What percentage 9 would we be looking at? You're still looking to maintain 40 10 11 foot in the front? 12 MR. CAVELLERO: Correct. 13 MS. CAVELLERO: Correct. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Instead of the 15 depth being --16 MR. CAVELLERO: 36. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: -- 36. MR. CAVELLERO: Come down to 30. 18 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You'd come down 20 to 30? MR. CAVELLERO: Lower the roof a 21 22 foot. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That sounds like 1,200 square foot to me. 24 25 MR. MATTINA: Yup.

1	Richard Cavellero 99
2	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I can do that
3	without a calculator.
4	MR. MATTINA: That allows you 200
5	square foot over, which would be 20
6	percent.
7	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: In that instance,
8	if they reduced the rear by 6 feet, they
9	would only be 200 square feet over?
10	MR. MATTINA: Correct.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's it.
12	MR. MATTINA: They're allowed 1,000.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You're allowed
14	1,000 and you're at 1,200 if you reduce
15	it to 40 by 30.
16	You talked about coming down in
17	height also.
18	MR. CAVELLERO: We can go down if
19	we had to.
20	MS. CAVELLERO: We would have to
21	get that worked out again.
22	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: There's structural
23	information that needs to be adjusted for
24	stuff like that. 40 by 30. What's a
25	typical garage width?

1	Richard Cavellero 100
2	MR. CAVELLERO: Ours right now I
3	think is like
4	MS. CAVELLERO: Don't look at me.
5	MR. CAVELLERO: I measured it a
6	hundred times. I think it was like 29
7	wide.
8	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Let's say it's
9	10, 10 and 10 for the doors.
10	MR. CAVELLERO: Side to side.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: What do you need
12	between them?
13	MR. CAVELLERO: The plans I believe
14	was 7.5, I believe.
15	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: If you were 10,
16	10 and 10 and then you had two exterior
17	walls, say they're a foot lets say two
18	for the sake of easy math. You've got 30
19	feet plus 4 would be 34. 1.5 and 1.5 is
20	3.
21	MR. CAVELLERO: I just need room
22	between the doors to put a garage opener
23	on the wall.
24	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I think you see
25	where I'm going. I'm whittling you down

2 just to see how far I can push you. 3 That's not it, though. I'm trying to 4 maintain -- I don't even live in your 5 neighborhood. I admire it. I'm trying to maintain some of the character of your 6 7 neighborhood. 8 MR. CAVELLERO: Of course. 9 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Your neighbors had an opportunity to come here and 10 11 speak. Like I say, we also don't want to 12 create --13 MR. CAVELLERO: A precedent. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We don't want to 15 set a precedent. We get ourselves in 16 trouble if somebody else comes in asking 17 for exactly what you did and we say no. 18 What's the latest numbers on the 19 table? 20 MS. CAVELLERO: Were you writing any of that down? 21 MR. MATTINA: 1,200 would be 200 22 23 square foot over, which would be 20 24 percent at 40 times 30. 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You're still

2 looking at 40 across the front. The 3 biggest I could whittle you down and 4 still keep stuff for the button would be 5 37 across the front, 2 foot on either side, that would be 34, and then two 6 7 center posts at 1.5 half makes 3 more, so that would be 37. Does that make sense? 8 9 Is that something you could live with?

10 MR. CAVELLERO: I'm not having door 11 openers on the ceiling. They mount to 12 the side of the door. Picture inside of 13 a garage. You look at the inside of the 14 garage door, you look up in the right 15 I need to have space to mount corner. 16 That's what I'm concerned about. it. А 17 lot of houses have conventional openers.

18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mine is loud.

MR. CAVELLERO: These ones, they mount to like the spring and the roller that are attached to the frame of the door. There has to be ample space to mount these things to open and close the door.

25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay.

103 1 Richard Cavellero 2 MR. HERMANCE: How much room are we 3 talking? 4 MR. CAVELLERO: Each unit I think 5 is like 16 inches wide. I could be wrong. I don't know the specifications. 6 7 They're not like 3 feet across. They're 8 powerful little motors that are mostly 9 rectangular. 10 MR. HERMANCE: Doesn't the 11 pulley --12 MR. CAVELLERO: There's a beam that 13 goes across and rolls up the cord or 14 whatever. I'm not a garage door opener 15 guy. 16 MR. HERMANCE: It's the coil spring. 17 MR. CAVELLERO: It's the coil 18 spring on the door itself. It mounts to 19 that rod or pulley. That's what's 20 functioning the door opening and closing. 21 Before I agree, I just want to make 22 sure there's ample space to make sure 23 they work. I might decide to do that in 24 the future. 25 MS. CAVELLERO: Just like you love

2	our neighborhood, we do too. We don't
3	plan on going anywhere for a long time.
4	We want to be able to grow and finish
5	those things like he wants, like the
6	garage door openers. He knows what he
7	wants in the future piece by piece.
8	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I understand you
9	completely.
10	Again, just one of the silly quick
11	numbers. 30 depth. If you were to go
12	10, 10, 10 for each door, 2 foot at each
13	end, 4 foot, and then in the middle. 2
14	foot is a little more. That gets you to
15	that would be 38 instead of the 40
16	you're asking for, and then you end up
17	with 1,140 square feet. You're only 140
18	square feet over.
19	MR. MATTINA: 14 percent.
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: There you go.
21	Now we're getting better. Like I say,
22	you're counsel, kick me when I'm going
23	wrong here.
24	MR. DONOVAN: I'm a word guy. I
25	have no idea what you're doing. I have

2 no idea if that building is going to 3 work. It all sounds great when you play with numbers. 4 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm looking at 6 this. You can say, you know, Zoning 7 Board of Appeals, we like our application 8 exactly as it's being presented and we 9 would like you to vote on it that way, 10 and we will. Or you can say, hey, you 11 know, I see the hesitation you're 12 getting, at least out of one Board 13 Member, and this is what we think we can 14 do to reduce the size to be more in 15 character with the neighborhood, still 16 over what's allowed, but not by much now. 17 MR. CAVELLERO: Can I look at those 18 plans? I didn't bring my copy. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Do you want to 20 look at your application? 21 MR. CAVELLERO: To see the numbers. 22 I want to see the picture with the door. 23 I'm sorry. That's what you're referring 24 to. 25 MS. JABLESNIK: You can rip it.

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: While you're 3 digging out what you're digging out there, because this is a matter of public 4 5 record now, these meeting minutes are 6 recorded, should we get to that point 7 where we're granting something or nothing 8 at all, if you choose to reduce it down 9 to 1,000 square feet, we want assurances 10 that you will not be running any 11 automotive repair shop. 12 MR. CAVELLERO: No. I mean, I have 13 a hobby on a Saturday or something. Can 14 T do that? 15 MS. CAVELLERO: It's not for 16 business. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You and all your 18 friends and their kids and --19 MR. CAVELLERO: You're talking 20 about 38? I'm trying to picture in my 21 mind what you're referring to. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Each end is 2 23 feet. Everything is 2, 2 and 2. You 24 could have it work, and that gives you 38. 25

107 1 Richard Cavellero 2 MR. CAVELLERO: I could live with 3 that. 2, 2, 2. Yeah, that's fine. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Do you understand? 5 MR. CAVELLERO: Yeah. 6 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you. 7 Joe Mattina, are you following 8 along? 9 MR. MATTINA: Just barely. 10 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I do not want to suggest anything that you -- so where I'm 11 12 going with this --13 MS. CAVELLERO: We can ask them to 14 vote on what you presented originally or 15 listen to the suggestions. 16 MR. CAVELLERO: The suggestion 17 would be great. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm not dictating 19 anything. I'm recognizing that you're in 20 here asking for a variance because you're 21 asking for more than what's allowed. 22 There we have it. 23 The public hearing is still open. 24 The gentleman in the back with the well-25 behaved young lady, are you following

2	along with this as well?
3	MR. BAKER: Yes. She is, too.
4	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: She's great.
5	I've talked a lot. Sorry,
6	Michelle. This isn't stuff that I
7	typically say either, so you have to
8	really work.
9	Because I just brought up a couple
10	of different things here, does anybody
11	have
12	MR. HERMANCE: I have a question.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Sure.
14	MR. HERMANCE: With the roof size,
15	the area of roof is going to be
16	considerable, are there any stormwater
17	management requirements for
18	MR. MATTINA: The residential code
19	doesn't get into that.
20	MR. HERMANCE: There's going to
21	be
22	MR. CAVELLERO: I'm going to put a
23	gutter.
24	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Throw them into a
25	pile of stones or something.
109 1 Richard Cavellero 2 All right. At this point it 3 doesn't look like anybody else from the 4 public wants to speak. I'll look to the 5 Board for a motion to close the public 6 hearing. 7 MR. MASTEN: I'll make a motion to 8 close the public hearing. MS. REIN: I'll second. 9 10 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You guys are so 11 excited down there, I can see it. We 12 have a motion from Mr. Masten. We have a 13 second from Ms. Rein. All in favor. 14 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 15 MR. HERMANCE: Ave. 16 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 17 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 18 MS. REIN: Aye. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Those opposed? 20 (No response.) 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Silence. 22 Okay. What we've got in front of 23 us, folks, is an application that, 24 through dialogue with the applicant, it 25 sounds to me like we have now -- we're

2	now looking at an application that
3	perhaps is a structure that's 38 feet
4	wide by 30 feet deep.
5	What was the height, the last
6	height that was mentioned?
7	MS. REIN: 21 something.
8	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Because the
9	cupola is off.
10	MR. DONOVAN: I had 21.2 3/4, just
11	so we're clear.
12	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes.
13	MR. DONOVAN: When Mr. Mattina has
14	his tape measure and he's up at the
15	top
16	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm curious if he
17	ever really does that.
18	MR. DONOVAN: He has people.
19	MS. JABLESNIK: He does have
20	people.
21	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'll ask the
22	applicants, is that the way you would
23	like to proceed or would you like to have
24	the application go exactly as presented?
25	MR. CAVELLERO: I agree with what

2	we discussed, what we talked about.
3	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: All right.
4	MS. REIN: Then we can approve this
5	with conditions. Correct?
6	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Absolutely.
7	MR. DONOVAN: If I can make a
8	suggestion. I don't think it would be
9	with conditions. I think we're going to
10	deem the application amended to have a 38
11	by 30 building with a height of 21 feet
12	2 3/4 inches. Are we doing engineering
13	points or
14	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: That's
15	architectural drawings. I'll give you
16	the inches, Dave.
17	MR. CAVELLERO: I was going down.
18	20 foot and $3/4$. I went from 14 foot to
19	13 foot ceilings?
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes.
21	MR. CAVELLERO: I just want to make
22	sure.
23	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Now we have a new
24	number.
25	MR. CAVELLERO: I mentioned taking

2	it a foot down. I'll be honest.
3	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Very good. I
4	appreciate that. Now we're looking at a
5	total building height of 20 foot 2 3/4.
6	Okay. Now we're going to go ahead
7	and ask our area variance questions.
8	MR. DONOVAN: Did you close the
9	public hearing?
10	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I believe I did.
11	MR. DONOVAN: I'm just checking.
12	I'm not saying you didn't. I'm just
13	checking.
14	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you.
15	This is a Type 2 action under
16	SEQRA. Correct, Counsel?
17	MR. DONOVAN: That is correct, Mr.
18	Chairman.
19	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I want to make
20	sure I'm doing everything right now. I'm
21	slipping.
22	We're going to go through the area
23	variance criteria, the first one being
24	whether or not this benefit can be
25	achieved by other means feasible to the

applicant.

2 3 MS. REIN: No. 4 MR. HERMANCE: No. 5 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The second, if there's an undesirable change in the 6 7 neighborhood character or a detriment to 8 nearby properties. While we may not 9 think so, we may hear about it later from 10 other people. The applicant has reduced the size, so the variance that they are 11 12 asking for is severely reduced from what 13 they came in here with. 14 The third, whether the request is 15 substantial. Now we're only at 140 feet 16 over, 14 percent, which is a heck of a 17 lot better than it was before. 18 The fourth, whether the request 19 will have adverse physical or 20 environmental effects. 21 MS. REIN: No. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It does not 23 appear so. 24 The fifth, whether the alleged 25 difficulty is self-created, which of

114 1 Richard Cavellero 2 course it is. 3 If the Board approves, it shall 4 grant the minimum variance necessary and 5 may impose reasonable conditions. 6 We have an amended application. As 7 far as a reasonable condition, I just 8 want your clarification that there will 9 be no automotive repair shop being --10 MR. CAVELLERO: No. 11 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: -- run out of 12 this structure. 13 MR. CAVELLERO: No. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. Having 15 gone through the balancing tests, does the Board have a motion of some sort? 16 17 MR. MASTEN: I'll make a motion to 18 approve it. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: With the new 20 values that --21 MR. MASTEN: The new readjustment. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 23 from Mr. Masten. Do we have a second? 24 MS. REIN: I'll second it. 25 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a second

1 Richard Cavellero 2 from Ms. Rein. 3 Can you roll on that, please, 4 Siobhan. 5 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart? 6 MR. EBERHART: Yes. 7 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten? 8 MR. MASTEN: Yes. 9 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance, I 10 forgot you. 11 MR. DONOVAN: He started to cry. 12 MS. JABLESNIK: I'm very sorry. 13 MR. HERMANCE: Yes. 14 MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein? 15 MS. REIN: Yes. 16 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo? 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. 18 The amended application is 19 approved. 20 MR. CAVELLERO: Thank you. 21 MS. CAVELLERO: Thank you. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: At least I've 23 tried to entertain you through the 24 evening. 25 MR. CAVELLERO: You have.

1	Richard Cavellero
2	(Time noted: 8:25 p.m.)
3	
4	CERTIFICATION
5	
6	
7	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
8	for and within the State of New York, do
9	hereby certify:
10	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
11	record of the proceedings.
12	I further certify that I am not
13	related to any of the parties to this
14	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
15	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
16	this matter.
17	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
18	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	FIGUEDE CONERO
24	
25	

1				11
2	STATE OF NEW YO TOWN OF NEWBURGH			
3	In the Matter of		X	
4				
5	CDA	rk car wa	сп	
6				
7	1227-1229 F Section 96;			
8	±	D 20116		
9			X	
10			October 24, 2024	
11		Time:	8:25 p.m.	
12		Place:	Town Hall 1496 Route 300	
13			Newburgh, New Yor	k
14				
15	BOARD MEMBERS:		SCALZO, Chairman BERHART, JR.	
16		GREGORY	M. HERMANCE	
17		JOHN MAS DONNA RE		
18				
19	ALSO PRESENT:	JOSEPH M		
20		STORHAN	JABLESNIK	
21	APPLICANT'S REPRES		S: JENNIFER PORTE RIO, PAUL MUTCH &	R,
22		HOLAS TOR	•	
23			X	
24	Cou	rt Report	ter	
25	Michellec (84	onerognot 15)541-41		

2	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: This was held
3	open from the September 26th meeting
4	which was held open from the August
5	meeting which we didn't have.
6	MS. PORTER: The July meeting.
7	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You folks had a
8	conflict last month, which is why you're
9	here this month.
10	MS. PORTER: Originally we we
11	didn't have the determination, so we had
12	to hold it open from July.
13	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Were we here in
14	August?
15	MS. JABLESNIK: We were not. It
16	was my fault.
17	MS. PORTER: We couldn't do the
18	one-stop shop in July.
19	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Here we are. We
20	have Spark Car Wash. I believe we heard
21	most of this all before.
22	MS. PORTER: You did.
23	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We hadn't
24	received County back by then.
25	MS. PORTER: Right.

1	Spark	Car Wash 119
2		CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Boy, are they way
3		past their time.
4		MS. PORTER: They did respond. All
5		they said is we have no comments, Local
6		determination.
7		CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I remember the
8		presentation. Once we're done, it goes
9		back to the Planning Board,
10		MS. PORTER: Yes.
11		CHAIRMAN SCALZO: should you get
12		what you're looking for.
13		MS. PORTER: Yes.
14		CHAIRMAN SCALZO: But, you know,
15		I'm going to stop myself right now and
16		say it's been so long, can you just give
17		me the Reader's Digest version
18		MS. PORTER: Sure.
19		CHAIRMAN SCALZO: of the
20		variances that you're looking for?
21		MS. PORTER: I'm Jen Porter, I'm
22		with CSG Law. I'm here on behalf of
23		Spark Car Wash. We're going to have Paul
24		Mutch, our civil engineer, walk you
25		through quickly the three area variances

2 we're seeking to give you a recap, and 3 then we're here to answer any questions. We have our traffic consultant, because 4 5 one of the variances relates specifically 6 to the driveway to the property line. We 7 have Rob Vallario from Spark if you have 8 operational questions. I know there were 9 some questions that came up at the last 10 meeting with regard to the operations as 11 it related specifically to the car wash 12 and the rear yard setback and that 13 particular variance. Any questions you 14 have after you hear the presentation, 15 we're happy to answer. 16 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Once you start, 17 I'm sure we're all going to remember what 18 you said before. You can keep it to an 19 outline. 20 MS. JABLESNIK: I wasn't here. 21 I do remember CHAIRMAN SCALZO: 22 there's like a gold card that you can 23 have. 24 MR. VALLARIO: I'm still working on 25 getting one for myself.

2 MR. MUTCH: Again, just very 3 briefly, we have a state-of-the-art, 4 fully automated car wash use here. The 5 business is really driven by memberships 6 like you're talking about. They provide 7 percs, like the vacuum stations that have 8 all kinds of tools you can use to clean 9 your car. There's a Spark park station. 10 It's meant to be efficient. The 11 experience is meant to be top notch. 12 People want to be members, come back a 13 couple times a month. It usually ranges 14 in the 50 to 60 percent. It's meant to 15 be convenient, it's meant to be 16 efficient, friendly employees onsite. 17 All the things you would expect. 18 We have a modern reclaim system

19 where all of those car wash fluids are 20 not coming out and running onto the 21 That's not a thing here. street. It all 22 gets reclaimed, filtered and reused in 23 the building. It's just a modern state-24 of-the-art car wash, very different from 25 the car washes you saw in the past.

2 The site is constrained on two 3 sides by a stream. It runs down this 4 side and then behind the site, so those 5 -- on the eastern side -- it's the 6 northern side you have a natural and 7 permanent buffer. Nobody could ever 8 develop back there. You have a stream, wetlands. 9 10 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We discussed 11 this. It is Federal. Correct? 12 MR. MUTCH: Yes. That will be wooded forever. That leads to the first 13 14 variance, which is a rear yard setback 15 variance. We pressed that building back 16 to basically where the edge of the 17 existing pavement is today. We're not 18 expanding the development past the 19 existing pavement. That building will 20 sit along the existing treeline against 21 that natural buffer. That encroachment 22 in the rear yard does not have an impact, 23 from my perspective, on the neighbors 24 because we have that natural and 25 permanent buffer behind the site.

2 MS. REIN: Can I ask you something 3 and interrupt? I made notes last time 4 about the stream contamination.

5 Yes. There will be no MR. MUTCH: stream contamination associated with this 6 7 Right now basically the entire use use. flows overland and kind of meanders into 8 9 that stream. Some of it goes to the DOT. We're collecting all of that water onsite 10 11 and conveying it mostly to the DOT 12 frontage. That's just specifically 13 parking lot runoff. We're going to clean 14 that up with more landscaping and better 15 conveyance. As far as the chemicals or 16 the cleaning fluids inside, the entire 17 tunnel is pitched. It all gets collected 18 in a reclaimed system, filtered. Anv 19 effluent from that goes into the sanitary 20 sewer system. It's never exposed to the 21 landscaping, the runoff or the stream in 22 any way. You're only going to have 23 parking lot runoff going anywhere near 24 that stream. No car wash fluids. 25 MS. REIN: You changed that, didn't

2 you, because it wasn't going into the 3 sanitary sewer system before? 4 MR. MUTCH: The effluent from the 5 car washing itself was always going into 6 the sanitary sewer system. Because that 7 will have some residual soaps and things 8 in it, it has to go to the sanitary. We 9 do not go to the storm system in any way. 10 MS. REIN: Thank you. 11 MR. MUTCH: Absolutely. 12 So I described the first variance. 13 The second variance is a front yard 14 setback variance. We have a pay station 15 structure along the frontage. It is a 16 small structure. It's only about 7 to 10 17 feet in height, depending on the model 18 we're using out there. It's 23 feet from 19 the front property line, from the edge of 20 the canopy to the property line itself, 21 where a 60-foot buffer would be required. 22 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Required for a 23 State highway. 24 MR. MUTCH: Exactly. It's more the 25 size of the sign than the building. We

2

3

feel the impact is pretty minimal to the overall roadway network.

4 Spark, from this plan, has made 5 their pay stations more efficient in general. There are more kiosks with 6 7 canopies rather than the large structure. The setback will be the same at that 23 8 9 feet. The overall structure and the massing of that pay station will be even 10 11 less in the final condition.

MR. DONOVAN: Could I just interrupt? MR. DONOVAN: Could I just interrupt? There was a question last time, I read through the minutes, as to whether or not the canopy and kiosk were structures for which you needed a variance.

17 MR. MUTCH: I think we all decided 18 that we would need that variance at the 19 last meeting. We're pursuing it. Again, 20 these kiosks are only about eight feet in 21 height and they sit separately rather 22 than the full canopy. There is a manned 23 kiosk out there. An employee is out 24 there to help people as they come 25 through, those daily riders that might

2 need help with the system, and also to 3 keep the lanes operating efficiently. We talked about the fact that a couple of 4 5 these lanes will be members only lanes 6 for the people with the passes. If you 7 get a long queue that's stacked up, they 8 all function the same, the employee there 9 can direct people to use all the lanes to 10 make sure that's operating in a very 11 efficient manner. That's variance number 12 two.

13 The third variance is the 14 separation of our driveway from our 15 property line. The existing driveway 16 actually goes beyond our property line. 17 It's a couple of feet past. We're 18 pulling the curb radius of our driveway 19 back into our property. It's 1.8 feet 20 where 10 feet is required. It's a big 21 It's 33 feet. radius. That was all 22 driven by the DOT. We have received 23 approval from the DOT. There were no 24 further plan comments. They just said 25 apply for your highway occupancy permits

25

2 and construction permits. We'll do that. 3 That's a positive for that driveway. The 4 effective width really there to any 5 interaction of other driveways, it's more 6 like 100 feet as they operate today. 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay. I don't 8 know if my question is going to be for 9 you or not. With the canopy, there are 10 three -- you can go through three 11 separate entrances to get in there? 12 MR. MUTCH: That's correct. Yes. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: One of them is 13 going to be dedicated to members. 14 Would 15 that be the one that's going to be 16 closest to the right-of-way? 17 MR. MUTCH: That is going to be the 18 closest. Typically that manned shelter 19 will be closest to the interior lane 20 which is where you'll have that daily 21 rider. Usually they start with one and 22 it goes to two. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The assumption is 24 that members would kind of know their way

around the facility so they won't be the

2 ones jamming it up. I'm worried about 3 stacking room. 4 MR. MUTCH: I can go into a spiel 5 about stacking. This is what I'm here for. 6 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Coming in off 8 300, obviously it's a right in/right out 9 only? 10 MR. MUTCH: No. This is a full 11 movement driveway. 12 STPHAO: The DOT approved it as a 13 full movement. 14 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Is there a 15 turning lane? 16 MR. MUTCH: There is turn lane. 17 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It's rough when 18 I'm trying to get into Home Depot. All 19 right. 20 MR. MUTCH: It may be a self-21 policing left turn, but the DOT was 22 comfortable with it. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm not that guy. 24 People waiting to -- well, the circulation 25 itself through the site, the activity of

1 Spark Car Wash 2 getting your car washed, will that 3 facilitate keeping the stacking or the 4 queue low? 5 MR. DONOVAN: Tell us who you are for the record. 6 7 MR. TORTORELLA: Nicholas Tortorella, 8 traffic and transportation engineer with 9 Stonefield Engineering & Design. 10 To touch on your point here, we 11 have three ingress lanes with a total of 12 sixteen vehicle stacking spaces. 13 We spoke about the members only 14 Spark has a license plate lane. 15 recognition software for members. Tt. 16 functions like an EZ-Pass gate, if you 17 could picture that. Through these gates, 18 member transactions take about ten 19 seconds. It's extremely fast. You're 20 essentially progressing unimpeded as the 21 software recognizes your license plate. 22 As Paul said earlier, there is a 23 dedicated attendant here to serve the 24 non-members lane. Those transactions 25 take about thirty-five to fifty seconds.

2

3

Still relatively fast, but definitely longer than the members.

4 Again I'll say we have the sixteen 5 total vehicle stacking spaces upstream of 6 the gates alone. What we wanted to do to 7 verify that we have adequate stacking 8 space, because we certainly do not want 9 the queues backing up to the driveway and 10 impeding traffic flows into or out of the 11 site, we conducted observations at an 12 existing Spark facility located along two 13 state highways in Sicklerville, New 14 Jersey. What we observed at that Spark 15 facility is during a peak Friday and a 16 peak Saturday period, which are the 17 highest periods of activity for the car 18 wash, the highest queue we observed in 19 any single lane was five total vehicles 20 in a non-member lane. Three minutes 21 after we observed that peak queue, that 22 stacking had gone down to only two 23 vehicles in only three minutes. Really 24 throughout the entire peak periods we 25 observed queues of no more than three

2	cars in the non-member lane, no more than
3	two cars in a member lane. When you look
4	at it from providing sixteen total
5	stacking spaces, we really expect this is
6	going to be more than enough queueing
7	space to accommodate even the peak demand
8	that could occur here without this queue
9	really ever approaching the driveway and
10	impacting flows into and out of the site.
11	Specifically to your question, Mr.
12	Chairman. It will definitely not impact
13	the traffic flows on Route 300 itself.
14	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Got you. Just so
15	I'm clear, exiting your facility you can
16	make a right or a left?
17	MR. MUTCH: A right or a left.
18	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Okay.
19	MS. JABLESNIK: Can we pretend I'm
20	a member, because I have a question?
21	What if you don't have a license plate on
22	the front of your car?
23	MR. TORTORELLA: It's the rear.
24	MR. MUTCH: You are required, in
25	New York, to have a front license plate.

132 1 Spark Car Wash 2 MS. JABLESNIK: We don't need to 3 say that out loud. 4 MR. TORTORELLA: Any further 5 questions pertaining to that? CHAIRMAN SCALZO: No. Traffic 6 7 engineering is an art in itself based on 8 projections or crystal balls or something 9 like that, I'm not sure. I'm all right. 10 I've got nothing. 11 I'm going to start at that end. 12 Ms. Rein? 13 MS. REIN: No dog washes? 14 MR. TORTORELLA: No. Absolutely 15 not. Every time I drive past that dog 16 wash -- I mentioned it to Bob. 17 MR. MUTCH: No dog washes and no 18 servicing of vehicles. 19 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You probably 20 don't have regular people wash showers 21 either. 22 That's a good thing. MS. REIN: 23 Hose you down as you go. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Drive the 25 convertible and leave the top down.

2 Mr. Masten? 3 MR. MASTEN: I have nothing. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Hermance? 5 MR. HERMANCE: The vacuum area is off on the side. That won't impede 6 7 exiting as people are vacuuming? 8 MR. TORTORELLA: Absolutely not. 9 Each vehicle gets its own individual 10 vacuum station. They have all the materials there to clean your car. It's 11 12 all self-service. 13 As Paul eluded to earlier, there 14 are specific stations that allow you to 15 vacuum your mats more efficiently. 16 Again, this is 24 feet wide, so we 17 do not expect anything in this Spark park 18 area to affect traffic circulation on 19 this egress roadway and really have 20 anything to do with traffic entering or 21 exiting. 22 MS. REIN: I do have one other 23 question. Is there a time change in the 24 queue because of the services asked for? 25 Some people will ask for just the wash,

2	some people will ask for different things
3	going on with that, the tire shine and
4	there are different packages.
5	MR. TORTORELLA: Just to clarify,
6	are you asking if there's a change in
7	time at the wash tunnel or the gate
8	itself?
9	MS. REIN: That would affect each
10	other.
11	MR. TORTORELLA: Very simply, and
12	feel free to add anything if you feel
13	like it, in the wash tunnel itself, the
14	process from start to finish takes
15	between two and two and a half minutes
16	really no matter what package.
17	MS. REIN: Regardless of the
18	package?
19	MR. TORTORELLA: You pull up, you
20	pull to a roller, put your car in neutral
21	with the help of a dedicated attendant
22	and it takes you through the entire
23	process, including drying.
24	MS. REIN: The flow won't change
25	regardless of the package?

2	MR. TORTORELLA: Absolutely not.
3	Spark has the ability to increase the
4	speed of that wash tunnel if they ever
5	needed to. We have not come across that
6	situation. If it were ever necessary,
7	they have the ability to increase the
8	speed so it takes about ninety seconds as
9	opposed to two to two and a half minutes,
10	like I referenced earlier, without
11	affecting the quality of the wash at all.
12	The reason they don't always run it
13	at ninety seconds is it's really not
14	necessary most of the time and it has
15	increased wear and tear on machinery that
16	could lead to increased operations cost
17	really for no reason. It's just another
18	added benefit that they have.
19	MS. REIN: Thank you.
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Good?
21	MR. MASTEN: Yeah.
22	MR. HERMANCE: I have nothing
23	further.
24	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Bachmueller,
25	you're the only member of the public.

2 MR. BACHMUELLER: Ironically I'm 3 building a car wash in this intersection. 4 I'm thinking to myself, how could there 5 be another application. We're underway. That's why I waited around to listen to 6 7 this. 8 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: You know what, I 9 didn't even put that together. You folks 10 are under construction? 11 MR. BACHMUELLER: It's a different 12 car wash. It's the same distance from 13 17K. It's on the other side of the 14 intersection. 15 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The one at the old muffler joint. A lot of dirty cars 16 17 out there. 18 MR. BACHMUELLER: Apparently. 19 Apparently. I don't have any comments 20 really. It was a great presentation. 21 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I always like 22 hearing about level of service. You 23 didn't throw out that word. 24 MR. BACHMUELLER: If you need 25 somebody to built that turning lane, come

137 1 Spark Car Wash 2 see me. 3 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Mr. Bachmueller, 4 other than those comments, you've got 5 nothing else? MR. BACHMUELLER: No. 6 7 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you. I 8 appreciate you being here. 9 At this point I guess I'll look to 10 the Board for a motion to close the public hearing. 11 MR. EBERHART: I'll make the motion. 12 13 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: I'm going to give 14 it to Mr. Eberhart, only because he 15 finished first. Would you like to second 16 it? 17 MR. MASTEN: Yes. 18 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 19 from Mr. Eberhart. We have a second from Mr. Masten. All in favor. 20 21 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 22 MR. HERMANCE: Ave. 23 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 24 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 25 MS. REIN: Aye.

2 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: This is an 3 Unlisted action? 4 MR. DONOVAN: Mr. Chairman, last 5 time I said it was an Unlisted action, I think I got hung up on the fact that it's 6 7 under 4,000 square feet. Reading the 8 SEQRA regulations, a setback and lot line 9 variances are Type 2 actions. Even 10 though there's a separate section for single-family, two-family, three-family, 11 12 I'm going to admit a mistake. 13 MS. REIN: A Type 2? 14 MS. PORTER: A Type 2 versus 15 Unlisted. Why not. 16 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: It's one less 17 step. 18 MR. DONOVAN: Obviously the 19 Planning Board -- just to be clear, the 20 Planning Board will go through their 21 SEQRA process. 22 MS. PORTER: It's an uncoordinated 23 review. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Thank you. All 25 right. So we don't have to go through

1	Spark Car Wash 139
2	that whole other determination. You've
3	heard it all before.
4	The first factor, whether the
5	benefit can be achieved by other means
6	feasible to the applicant.
7	MR. EBERHART: No.
8	MR. HERMANCE: No.
9	MR. MASTEN: No.
10	MS. REIN: No.
11	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Second, if
12	there's an undesirable change in the
13	neighborhood character or a detriment to
14	nearby properties.
15	MR. EBERHART: No.
16	MR. HERMANCE: No.
17	MR. MASTEN: No.
18	MS. REIN: No.
19	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: No. You know,
20	Route 300 is I love what it's done for
21	my taxes, but I avoid it during rush
22	hour.
23	Third, whether the request is
24	substantial.
25	MS. REIN: Yes.

2	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The fourth,
3	whether the request will have adverse
4	physical or environmental effects. We've
5	been assured by the engineer that there
6	have been mitigating efforts employed to
7	prevent any big environmental effects.
8	The fifth, whether the alleged
9	difficulty is self-created, which of
10	course it is. They're here asking for
11	permission and not for forgiveness, which
12	half of our applicants seem to be here
13	for.
14	Having gone through the balancing
15	tests, does the Board have a motion of
16	some sort?
17	MS. REIN: I'll make a motion to
18	approve.
19	MR. HERMANCE: I'll second.
20	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion
21	for approval from Ms. Rein. We have a
22	second from Mr. Hermance.
23	Can you roll on that, please,
24	Siobhan.
25	MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Eberhart?

2 MR. EBERHART: Yes. 3 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Hermance? 4 MR. HERMANCE: Yes. 5 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Masten? MR. MASTEN: Yes. 6 7 MS. JABLESNIK: Ms. Rein? 8 MS. REIN: Yes. 9 MS. JABLESNIK: Mr. Scalzo? 10 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Yes. 11 MS. PORTER: Great. 12 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The motion is carried. The variances are approved. 13 I 14 didn't mean to hang you up as long as we 15 did. 16 The only other order of business we 17 have are the meeting minutes from last 18 month. 19 MS. PORTER: The last item on your 20 agenda, the QuickChek, the attorney for 21 that application asked me to just briefly 22 ask the Board Attorney if there was an 23 extension needed for that application. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: The public 25 hearing is still open.

142 1 Spark Car Wash 2 MS. PORTER: Perfect. All right. 3 Thank you so much. 4 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Approval of the 5 meeting minutes from our last meeting. Do we have a motion for approval? 6 7 MR. EBERHART: I'll make the 8 motion. 9 MR. HERMANCE: Second. 10 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 11 from Mr. Eberhart. We have a second from 12 Mr. Hermance. All in favor of approval of last month's meeting minutes. 13 14 MR. EBERHART: Aye. 15 MR. HERMANCE: Aye. 16 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye. 17 MR. MASTEN: Aye. 18 MS. REIN: Aye. CHAIRMAN SCALZO: A motion to 19 20 adjourn. 21 MR. HERMANCE: I'll make the 22 motion. 23 MS. REIN: Second. 24 CHAIRMAN SCALZO: We have a motion 25 from Mr. Hermance and we have a second

2	from Ms. Rein. All in favor.
3	MR. EBERHART: Aye.
4	MR. HERMANCE: Aye.
5	CHAIRMAN SCALZO: Aye.
6	MR. MASTEN: Aye.
7	MS. REIN: Aye.
8	
9	(Time noted: 8:45 p.m.)
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	Spark Car Wash
2	
3	CERTIFICATION
4	
5	
6	I, MICHELLE CONERO, a Notary Public
7	for and within the State of New York, do
8	hereby certify:
9	That hereinbefore set forth is a true
10	record of the proceedings.
11	I further certify that I am not
12	related to any of the parties to this
13	proceeding by blood or by marriage and that
14	I am in no way interested in the outcome of
15	this matter.
16	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
17	set my hand this 31st day of October 2024.
18	
19	
20	
21	Michelle Conero
22	MICHELLE CONERO
23	MICHELLE CONERO
24	
25	